



Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru The National Assembly for Wales

Y Pwyllgor Cymunedau, Cydraddoldeb a Llywodraeth Leol The Communities, Equality and Local Government Committee

**Dydd Iau, 14 Tachwedd 2013
Thursday, 14 November 2013**

Cynnwys Contents

Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon
Introduction, Apologies and Substitutions

Comisiynydd y Gymraeg: Trafod Adroddiad Blynyddol 2012-13
Welsh Language Commissioner: Consideration of Annual Report 2012-13

Cofnodir y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal, cynhwysir trawsgrifiad o'r cyfieithu ar y pryd.

The proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee. In addition, a transcription of the simultaneous interpretation is included.

**Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol
Committee members in attendance**

Leighton Andrews	Llafur Labour
Peter Black	Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru Welsh Liberal Democrats
Christine Chapman	Llafur (Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor) Labour (Committee Chair)
Janet Finch-Saunders	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives
Mike Hedges	Llafur Labour
Jenny Rathbone	Llafur Labour
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales
Lindsay Whittle	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales

**Eraill yn bresennol
Others in attendance**

Meri Huws	Comisiynydd y Gymraeg Welsh Language Commissioner
Gwyn Williams	Cyfarwyddwr Cyfathrebu, Swyddfa Comisiynydd y Gymraeg Director of Communications, Office of the Welsh Language Commissioner

**Swyddogion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn bresennol
National Assembly for Wales officials in attendance**

Sarah Beasley	Clerc Clerc
Leanne Hatcher	Dirprwy Glerc Deputy Clerk
Rhys Iorwerth	Y Gwasanaeth Ymchwil Research Service

*Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 11:00.
The meeting began at 11:00.*

**Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon
Introduction, Apologies and Substitutions**

[1] **Christine Chapman:** Bore da, and welcome to the Assembly's Communities, Equality and Local Government Committee. I remind Members to switch off any mobile phones, because they affect the transmission. We have received apologies today from Mark Isherwood and Gwyn Price, who is substituting on another committee.

**Comisiynydd y Gymraeg: Trafod Adroddiad Blynyddol 2012-13
Welsh Language Commissioner: Consideration of Annual Report 2012-13**

[2] **Christine Chapman:** The first item on the agenda—the only item today—is the annual report from the Welsh Language Commissioner. I give a warm welcome to Meri Huws, the Welsh Language Commissioner, and Gwyn Williams, the director of

communications. We have obviously read the report, so, if you are happy for us to do so, we will move straight into questions and we can delve into the report. I see that you are happy to do that.

[3] I will start. Following the results of the census, what steps did you take to ensure that the official status of the Welsh language is, as you say in your report,

[4] ‘a reality that the people of Wales can see, hear and feel’?

[5] Could you comment on that?

[6] **Ms Huws:** Diolch yn fawr ichi am y cwestiwn a diolch ichi am y cyfle i drafod gyda chi ein hadroddiad cyntaf. Rydym yn gorff newydd iawn a gafodd ei sefydlu gan Fesur y Gymraeg (Cymru) 2011. Felly, dechrau'r daith yw hwn, a byddaf yn ymateb fel comisiynydd sydd wedi bod yn y swyddogaeth am brin 20 mis.

Ms Huws: Thank you very much for the question and for the opportunity to discuss our first report with you. We are a very new body that was established by the Welsh Language (Wales) Measure 2011. Therefore, this is the beginning of the journey, and I will respond as a commissioner who has been in post for barely 20 months.

[7] O weld ffigurau'r cyfrifiad, mae'r neges wedi cael ei dwyn gartref i mi fel comisiynydd ac i'r Llywodraeth yng Nghymru o ran pwysigrwydd sicrhau a symud i sicrhau statws swyddogol y Gymraeg. Rwy'n credu bod y ffigurau yn siomedig mewn rhai ffyrdd, ond maent hefyd yn rhoi cyfle inni, o edrych ar y ffigurau o ran pobl ifanc, i adeiladu, ac mae angen adeiladu ar frys.

From looking at the census figures, the message has been brought home to me as the commissioner, and the Welsh Government, about the importance of ensuring and taking action to safeguard the official status of the Welsh language. I think that the figures were disappointing in some ways, but they also give us an opportunity, looking at the figures for young people, to build, and there is a need to build very quickly.

[8] O ran y camau yr ydym wedi eu cymryd, hoffwn ateb y cwestiwn mewn sawl ffordd wahanol, ac rwy'n siŵr y byddwn yn dod yn ôl at amryw o agweddau ar yr ateb. Yn gyntaf, rwy'n credu ein bod wedi sylweddoli bod angen inni ddeall yn well beth sy'n digwydd yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd. Mae hyn wedi arwain yn uniongyrchol at sefydlu'r hyn yr ydym yn ei alw'n arsyllfa. Yr un peth sydd wedi dod yn amlwg iawn yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf yw bod lot fawr o wybodaeth, ffigurau a thystiolaeth ynglŷn â sefyllfa'r Gymraeg, ond nad yw pobl yn cymryd hynny yn ei gyfanrwydd. Rydym yn casglu ffigurau fan hyn a fan draw, ond nid oes gennym ddealltwriaeth lawn o'r hyn sy'n digwydd o ran ymfudo, mewnfudo ac allfudo. A ydym yn deall yn iawn yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn y system addysg? A ydym yn deall yn iawn beth sy'n digwydd o ran dilyniant pobl ifanc o addysg cyn-16 trwyddo i addysg bellach ac i'r gweithlu? A ydym yn deall beth sy'n digwydd yn ardaloedd fel Caerfyrddin ac ardaloedd eraill yn y

With regard to the steps that we have taken, I will respond to the question in several different ways, and I am sure that we will come back to several aspects of the answer. First, I think that we have realised that we need to understand better what is happening in Wales at present. This has led directly to the establishment of what we call an observatory. One thing that has become clear over the past few months is that there is a lot of information, figures and evidence in relation to the situation of the Welsh language, but people do not consider that holistically. We collect figures on a piecemeal basis, but we do not have a full understanding of what is happening in terms of migration, immigration and emigration. Do we fully understand what happens within the education system? Do we understand fully what happens with regard to continuity for young people from pre-16 education to further education and into the workforce? Do we understand what happens in areas such as Carmarthen and other areas in the west? In

gorllewin? Hefyd, byddwn yn gofyn a ydym yn deall beth yw goblygiadau'r newidiadau demograffig sy'n digwydd mewn lleoedd fel Caerdydd, Abertawe a Wrecsam, lle mae cynnydd mewn ardaloedd ac, o ganlyniad i hynny, cynnydd yn yr angen a'r galw am addysg uwch, dilyniant, a swyddi. Felly, roedd sefydlu'r arsyllfa, neu sefydlu ffocws ymchwil, yn bwysig inni ac mae hynny wedi ein galluogi ni i fwydo mewn i drafodaethau polisi mewn gwahanol feysydd. Bu trafodaeth gyda'r Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau ddydd Llun ynglŷn â dilyniant a bu trafodaeth ar yr un diwrnod gyda'r Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb am gynllunio, yn edrych ar y camau nesaf ar ôl nodyn cyngor technegol 20. Felly, rydym yn gweld yr arsyllfa yn ein galluogi ni i ddylanwadu ar bolisi a gwneud hynny mewn ffordd sy'n seiliedig ar dystiolaeth.

In addition, I would also ask whether we understand the implications of the demographic changes that are happening in places like Cardiff, Swansea and Wrexham, where there has been growth and, as a result of that, there has been a growth in the demand for higher education, continuity and jobs. So, establishing the observatory, or establishing a focus for research, is important to us and has allowed us to feed in to the policy discussions in different fields. There was a discussion with the Minister for Education and Skills on Monday on continuity and there was a discussion on the same day with the Minister with responsibility for planning, looking at the next steps following technical advice note 20. So, we see the observatory as allowing us to influence policy and to do that in a way that is based on evidence.

[9] Rydym hefyd yn gweld safonau a gweithrediad safonau, pan ddaw'r safonau i rym, fel ffordd ymlaen. Rwy'n awyddus iawn i sicrhau nad yw safonau a chydymffurfio â safonau, yn ymarferiad biwrocraidd yn unig, ond bod gweithredu o fewn cyfundrefn safonau yn arwain at newid ar lawr gwlad, yn arwain at newid o ran profiad y defnyddiwr, ond, hefyd, rwy'n gobeithio, yn rhoi realiti i statws swyddogol y Gymraeg—bod pobl yn teimlo eu bod yn gallu defnyddio'r Gymraeg fel defnyddwyr, a hefyd fel darparwyr, o wasanaethau yng Nghymru. Dyna'r ail elfen, sef sicrhau bod safonau yn arwain at newid profiad, nid jest yn ymarferiad biwocratig.

We also see standards, and the implementation of those standards, when they come into force, as a way forward. I am very eager to ensure that the standards and complying with standards, is not some sort of bureaucratic exercise, but that operating within that standards regime leads to a change at a grass-roots level, leading to a change in terms of user experience, but, also, I hope, giving reality to the official status of the Welsh language—that people feel they can use the Welsh language as users, and also as providers, of services in Wales. That is the second element, namely to ensure that standards lead to a change in experience and are not just a bureaucratic exercise.

[10] **Christine Chapman:** Meri, I know that some of these issues will arise in specific questions later, so, if you are happy, we will come on to those, if that is okay.

[11] **Ms Huws:** Os gallaf ddweud, y drydedd elfen—ac, eto, byddwn yn hapus iawn i ddod yn ôl at hyn—yw sicrhau cyfleoedd i bobl fagu hyder o ran defnyddio'r Gymraeg, boed hynny o fewn y trydydd sector neu o fewn y sector breifat. Mae'n ateb llawn, ond yr hyn yr hoffwn i ei bwysleisio yw nad un ateb sydd i'r cyfrifiad; mae angen y jig-so hwnnw a bod darnau'r jig-so yn dechrau ffitio at ei gilydd.

Ms Huws: If I may just say, the third element—and, again, I would be happy to come back to this—is to ensure opportunities for people to gain confidence in using the Welsh language, whether that is within the third sector or within the private sector. It is a comprehensive answer, but what I would like to emphasise is that there is not just one answer to the census; there is a need for that jigsaw and for the pieces of the jigsaw to start to fit together.

[12] **Christine Chapman:** I want to move on now. I think that Peter has a question.

[13] **Peter Black:** On the budget issue, I notice that for next year you have, effectively, 10% less to spend than you did during the current year. What discussions took place between you and the Welsh Government about that proposed cut of £400,000?

[14] **Ms Huws:** Rydym yn cyfarfod â swyddogion y Llywodraeth bob chwarter. Yn ystod yr haf eleni, bu neges led anffurfiol yn dweud bod ystyriaethau o doriadau o ran y gyllideb. Yr hyn a gawsom o ran gwybodaeth ffurfiol oedd y llythyr a dderbyniasom yn ystod wythnos y gyllideb yn dweud ein bod yn derbyn 10% o doriad. Wedi derbyn y llythyr hwnnw, fe wnes i ysgrifennu at y Prif Weinidog gan ddweud ein bod yn deall bod toriadau ym mhob agwedd ar fywyd cyhoeddus a'r sector gyhoeddus, a na ddylem gael ein heithrio o hynny, ond byddwn wedi bod yn awyddus i ddeall pa ganllawiau a ddefnyddiwyd wrth wneud y penderfyniad. Mae 10% yn doriad sylweddol mewn cyllideb, yn arbennig o ystyried ein bod yn gorff ifanc, 20 mis mewn i'n bodolaeth, ac yn sefydlu ein hunain fel corff un dyn. Felly, mae cael toriad o'r math hwnnw yn peri pryder wrth symud ymlaen.

Ms Huws: We meet with Government officials every quarter. During the summer of this year, there was a relatively informal message that cuts in relation to the budget were being considered. What we had in terms of formal information was the letter that we received during the week of the budget stating that we were receiving a cut of 10%. Following receipt of that letter, I wrote to the First Minister saying that we understand that there are cuts in all aspects of public life and the public sector, and that we should not be excepted from that, but I would have been eager to understand what guidelines were used in making that decision. A cut of 10% is a significant cut in a budget, especially considering that we are a young body, 20 months into our existence, and we are establishing ourselves as a one-man organisation. So, having a cut of that kind does cause some concern in moving forward.

[15] Rwyf hefyd wedi gofyn ei bod hi'n amlwg nawr ein bod yn cael llinell yn y gyllideb yn dangos pa doriadau sy'n disgyn arnom yn benodol ar hyn o bryd. Felly, ein hysbysiad ffurfiol oedd y llythyr a dderbyniasom oddi wrth y Llywodraeth, er ein bod ni wedi cael arwyddion anffurfiol bod ystyriaethau o ran toriadau.

I have also asked that it is clear now that we have a budget line that shows exactly what cuts fall on us specifically at present. So, our formal notification was the letter that we received from the Government, although we had had informal signs that there were considerations in terms of cuts.

[16] **Peter Black:** In the Children and Young People Committee earlier this month, the Minister for Education and Skills wrote to that committee to say that one of the reasons why that cut had taken place was because you actually underspent by £0.5 million this year.

[17] **Ms Huws:** O fod yn gorff newydd, roedd ein gwariant yn ystod y flwyddyn gyntaf yn ofalus, a chyda chytundeb Llywodraeth Cymru, edrychasom ar greu, nid cronfa wrth gefn, ond cronfa er mwyn sicrhau, pe bai angen i ni gymryd camau o ran achosion cyfreithiol, bod arian gennym. Roedd cytundeb i hynny i ddigwydd: bod ni yn defnyddio'r arian hwnnw er mwyn ein galluogi ni i edrych ar achosion cyfreithiol, pe baent yn codi.

Ms Huws: Being a new body, our expenditure during the first year was careful, and with the agreement of the Welsh Government, we looked at creating, not a reserve fund, but a fund in order to ensure that, if we needed to take steps in terms of legal cases, we had money. There was an agreement for that to happen: that we would use that money to enable us to look at legal cases, should they arise.

[18] **Peter Black:** What impact will that reduction have in the coming year and subsequent years on your work?

[19] **Ms Huws:** Mae'n anodd mewn un **Ms Huws:** It is difficult in one sense to

ffordd i ddisgrifio beth fydd effaith hynny, achos dim ond 20 mis rydym wedi bod mewn bodolaeth, felly un flwyddyn lawn rydym wedi rhedeg, a honno'n flwyddyn o sefydlu corff newydd, gyda chostau sefydlu corff newydd a phrofiad sefydlu corff newydd. Mae'n peri pryder i mi, wrth ein bod yn edrych i'r flwyddyn 2014-15, pan fyddwn yn rhedeg dwy system rheoleiddio—byddwn yn dal i gynnal cynlluniau iaith, a hefyd rydym yn gwybod yn awr y byddwn ni'n rheoleiddio'r safonau mewn 26 o gyrff, o leiaf.

describe what the effect of that will be, because we have only been in existence for 20 months, so we have only been running for one full year, and that was a year of establishing a new body, with the associated costs of establishing a new body and the experience of establishing a new body. It does cause me concern, as we look to the year 2014-15, when we will be running two regulatory systems—we will still be maintaining the language schemes, and also we know now that we will be regulating the standards in 26 bodies, at least.

[20] Mae'n peri pryder y bydd yn rhaid inni dorri corneli sylweddol wrth sefydlu strwythur sydd, i bob pwrpas, yn strwythur cyfreithiol. Mae hefyd yn golygu y bydd yn rhaid inni edrych yn ofalus iawn ar y gwaith yr ydym yn ei wneud gyda'r trydydd sector a'r sector preifat er mwyn cynyddu defnydd o'r iaith. Mae'n peri pryder. Nid wyf eisiau torri ar ein cynllun gwaith, ond mae perygl o hynny o fod yn wynebu 10% o doriad. Yr hyn a fyddai'n anodd iawn yw wynebu toriad tebyg yn y flwyddyn wedi hynny. Byddai hynny'n andwyol iawn o ran ein gwaith.

It is a cause of concern that we will have to cut corners significantly in establishing a structure that, to all intents and purposes, is a legal structure. It also means that we will have to look very carefully at the work that we are doing with the third sector and the private sector to increase use of the language. It does cause concern. I do not want to cut our work stream, but there is a danger of that in facing a 10% cut. What would be very difficult would be to face another similar cut in the year following that. That would be very detrimental in terms of our work.

[21] **Christine Chapman:** Thank you. Janet is next.

[22] **Janet Finch-Saunders:** Bore da. On the observatory that you mentioned, what are your ultimate aims for that? You have touched on the reasons for setting it up. What do you really expect to achieve? Also, what is your view on the Welsh Government's response to the results of the census, in particular the cynhadledd fawr—they have put that in to test me—and its outcomes?

[23] **Ms Huws:** O edrych ar yr arsyllfa, ac yr wyf wedi dechrau ar gyflwyniad o ran gwaith yr arsyllfa, rwyf wedi egluro pam sefydlasom ni'r arsyllfa. Gwnaethom sylweddoli bod angen i ni ddeall yn well y ffigurau, y data, a'r dystiolaeth sydd o ran y Gymraeg.

Ms Huws: Looking at the observatory, and I have started on a presentation in terms of the work of the observatory, I have explained why we established it. We realised that there was a need to better understand the figures, the data, and the evidence in relation to the Welsh language.

[24] Un peth sydd wedi fy nharo yn ystod yr 20 mis diwethaf yw bod cyfoeth o ddata yn eistedd mewn gwahanol leoedd, boed hynny o fewn Llywodraeth Cymru, o fewn swyddfa Comisiynydd y Gymraeg, neu o fewn awdurdodau lleol, ynglŷn â phatrymau o ran addysg, o ran cynllunio ac o ran yr economi. Yr hyn nad yw'n digwydd yw gweu'r data hynny at ei gilydd er mwyn deall yr hyn sy'n digwydd o ran y Gymraeg. Felly, yr hyn yr ydym yn ceisio ei wneud o fewn yr

One thing that has struck me in the last 20 months is that there is a wealth of data sitting in different areas, be that within the Welsh Government, within the Welsh Language Commissioner's office, or within local authorities, about patterns relating to education, planning and the economy. What is not happening is the weaving of that data together in order to understand what is happening in relation to the Welsh language. Therefore, what we are attempting to do with

arsyllfa yw gweithio o fewn swyddfa'r comisiynydd a chyda'r cyrff hynny i gyd—llywodraeth leol, prifysgolion, awdurdodau lleol a byrddau iechyd—i greu gwell dealltwriaeth er mwyn creu gwaelodlin gadarn o ddealltwriaeth, gwybodaeth ac ymchwil y gallwn ei ddibynnu arno wrth wneud argymhellion polisi. Rwyf hefyd yn gobeithio y bydd pobl a chyrff yn troi atom am wybodaeth wrth wneud penderfyniadau polisi. Felly, mae'n creu cadarnle o ran ymchwil data, sy'n cael ei yrru gan bolisi—nid tŵr gwyn academiaidd, ond rhywle lle mae dealltwriaeth.

the observatory is work within the commissioner's office and all of those bodies—local government, universities, local authorities and health boards—to create a better understanding in order to create a baseline of understanding, information and research that we can rely on when making policy recommendations. I also hope that people and bodies will turn to us for information when making policy decisions. So, it is creating a strong foundation in terms of research data, which is driven by policy—not an ivory tower, but somewhere where there is understanding.

[25] Rydym wedi gallu adeiladu ar hwnnw'n barod. Rydym wedi gwneud gwaith ar gynllunio ac wedi ei gyflwyno i'r Llywodraeth wrth iddi drafod TAN 20. Rydym hefyd wedi gwneud darn o waith ynglŷn â chronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd, ac wedi ei gyflwyno i'r Prif Weinidog ac i Weinidogion Cymru, fel cyngor o dan adran 4 y Mesur, ond fel argymhellion polisi ar sail gadarn o dystiolaeth.

We have been able to build on that already. We have done work on planning and presented that to the Government as it was discussing TAN 20. We have also done a piece of work on European structural funds, and presented that to the First Minister and Welsh Ministers, as advice under section 4 of the Measure, but as policy recommendations based on a strong foundation of evidence.

[26] **Janet Finch-Saunders:** I am aware that local authorities, my own included, have been quite proactive with their departments, with their emphasis on the Welsh language and writing up their policies on an almost routine annual basis. To what extent do you feel that that cascades down? Local authorities might have 6,000 or 7,000 employees, so how do you think that it cascades down from writing the strategy to its actually being understood, interpreted and then acknowledged throughout the whole culture and ethos of the local authority, or any public body for that matter?

[27] **Ms Huws:** Cwestiwn da. Rwy'n credu bod hynny'n un o'r sialensiau wrth symud ymlaen. Rwy'n gobeithio y bydd safonau'n galluogi i hynny ddigwydd. Mae cam mawr rhwng ysgrifennu polisi a gweithredu polisi. Y perygl yw ein bod wedi dod yn arbennig o dda yn ysgrifennu'r polisiau, ond nid ydym, o reidrwydd, yn rhannu hynny gyda'r staff ac yn ei droi'n realiti i staff. Hynny yw, 'Beth mae hyn yn ei feddwl i chi wrth ichi weithredu o ddydd i ddydd?'

Ms Huws: Good question. I think that that is one of the challenges in moving forward. I hope that standards will allow that to happen. There is a major step between writing policy and implementing policy. The danger is that we have become very good at writing the policies, but we are not necessarily sharing that with staff and turning that into a reality for staff. That is, 'What does this mean to you as you go about your work from day to day?'

[28] Rwyf wedi gweld esiamplau arbennig o le mae hynny wedi digwydd. Mae hynny'n dibynnu yn aml iawn ar arweinydd sy'n cymryd perchnogaeth o'r polisi hwnnw. Mae esiamplau amlwg yng ngogledd Cymru wedi bod lle mae arweinydd wedi cymryd hynny ac arwain o'r ffrynt. Dyna fydd yr her

I have seen excellent examples of where that has happened. That depends very often on a leader who takes ownership of that policy. There are clear examples in north Wales where a leader has taken that and led from the front. That will be the challenge with standards: to ensure, as standards are placed

gyda safonau: sicrhau, wrth i safonau gael eu gosod ar gyrff cyhoeddus a'r trydydd sector, bod perchnogaeth gan y prif weithredwr, a bod y prif weithredwr hwnnw'n sicrhau wedyn bod y staff yn deall goblygiadau hyn, a bod hi'n troi yn realiti o ddydd i ddydd ar lawr gwlad.

on public bodies and the third sector, that there is ownership by the chief executive, and that that chief executive then ensures that the staff understand the implications of this, and that it becomes a daily reality on the ground.

11:15

[29] **Janet Finch-Saunders:** Diolch yn fawr. **Janet Finch-Saunders:** Thank you.

[30] **Christine Chapman:** May I ask, Meri, how would you assess each—well, obviously, I do not want you to talk about each individual authority, but would you say there is a consistency of approach, or not?

[31] **Ms Huws:** Nac oes. Eto, rwyf wedi sôn tipyn am safonau, ac rwy'n gobeithio y bydd cyfundrefn safonau sy'n gyson i bob awdurdod yn caniatáu i awdurdodau adeiladu ar y gorau a rhannu arfer da. Byddant yn gweithio i'r un rheolau, mewn ffordd, ac rwy'n gobeithio y byddai hynny'n arwain at fwy o gysondeb. Mae enghreifftiau arbennig o gryf, yn y llefydd rhyfeddaf, weithiau, a nid yn y llefydd y byddech chi'n disgwyl, ac wedyn mae enghreifftiau nad ydynt mor gryf.

Ms Huws: No, there is not. Again, I have spoken a lot about standards, and I hope that a standards regime that will be consistent for each local authority will allow local authorities to build on the best and share good practice. They will be working to the same standards, and I hope that that would lead to more consistency. There are fantastically strong examples in the most surprising areas, sometimes, and not in areas that you would expect, and then there are examples that are not as robust.

[32] **Christine Chapman:** Thank you. Rhodri Glyn is next.

[33] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. Roedd yr ymateb blaenorol i Janet Finch-Saunders yn ddiddorol, oherwydd yr hyn yr oeddech yn ei ddweud oedd ein bod yn dda iawn yn ysgrifennu polisiau, ond nad ydym gystal yn eu gweithredu. Fel y gwyddoch, nid wyf yn ffafrio system safonau. Rwy'n credu ei bod hi'n drueni ein bod wedi gwastraffu amser dros y flwyddyn a hanner diwethaf yn ceisio paratoi system o safonau pan oedd cynlluniau iaith yno. Byddai wedi bod yn dda iawn gweld y comisiynydd yn gweithredu ar y cynlluniau iaith, oherwydd hynny oedd y gwendid—yn nyddiau Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg, nad oedd yr adnodd yno i reoleiddio yn ogystal â hyrwyddo'r cynlluniau iaith. Ta beth, rydym wedi mynd heibio hynny, ac rwyf wedi cael cyfle i ddweud fy nweud amdano.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Thank you, Chair. The previous response to Janet Finch-Saunders was interesting, because what you said was that we are very good at writing policy, but not as good at implementing it. As you know, I do not favour a standards system. I think that it is a shame that we have wasted time over the last year and a half trying to prepare a system of standards when there were language schemes in existence. It would have been very good to see the language commissioner acting on those, because that was the weakness—in the days of the Welsh Language Board, the resources were not there to regulate as well as to promote the language schemes. However, we have gone past that point, and I have had an opportunity to have my say on it.

[34] Fe wnaeth y comisiynydd geisio cyflwyno safonau, ac fe wrthodwyd hynny

The commissioner tried to introduce standards, and that was rejected by the former

gan y Gweinidog addysg blaenorol, sy'n digwydd bod yma gyda ni y bore yma. Beth yw'ch barn, felly, ynglŷn â'r amserlen sydd wedi cael ei gosod gan Lywodraeth Cymru nawr ynglŷn â chyflwyno safonau, o ystyried bod y comisiwn wedi'i sefydlu ers 18 mis nawr?

[35] **Ms Huws:** Yn gyntaf, os gallaf gymryd y cyfle i gyfeirio at y broses a aethom drwyddi yn ystod chwe mis cyntaf ein bodolaeth, fe wnaethom benderfynu cynnal proses ymgynghoriad anstatudol ar safonau. Y prif reswm dros wneud hynny oedd, yn ddrwg neu yn dda, bod safonau yn gyfundrefn sy'n unigryw i Gymru, pan ydych yn edrych ar safonau o ran iaith. Fe edrychasom ar draws y byd, ac nid oes map yn unrhyw le arall i'w ddilyn. Felly, y penderfyniad oedd, wrth sefydlu'r corff, bod angen i ni ddeall, a bod angen i Gymru ddeall, goblygiadau safonau. Dyna oedd pwrpas yr ymgynghoriad hwnnw: creu'r ddealltwriaeth honno, a chreu mwy o ymwybyddiaeth ynglŷn â hanfod safon, ac i gynnig canlyniadau'r profiad hwnnw i'r Llywodraeth fel darn o gyngor o dan adran 4. Dyna oedd y pwrpas. Rwy'n credu bod budd wedi bod i'r ymarferiad hwnnw achos, wrth ein bod yn trafod nawr gyda llywodraeth leol ac yn gweld yr amserlen yn agosáu, mae'n deall yn well beth yw'r safonau. Nid ydym yn dechrau o *base* isel, ac nid ydym yn dechrau o'r dechrau; mae mwy o ymwybyddiaeth.

[36] O ran yr amserlen, rwy'n falch o'i gweld. Rydym yn awr yn gwybod, erbyn 6 Ionawr, fe fydd y Llywodraeth yn cyhoeddi safonau, ac, ar y diwrnod hwnnw, fe fydd y llythyrau rhag-hysbysiad yn mynd allan i'r 26 o gyrff: Llywodraeth Cymru, llywodraeth leol, a'r awdurdodau parciau cenedlaethol. Rwy'n credu wedyn bod angen symud yn gymharol glou i symud y cyrff eraill a fydd yn dal i weithio o dan gynlluniau iaith drosodd i gyfundrefn safonau. Nid wyf yn credu y gallwn gynnal sefyllfa yng Nghymru a wnaiff arwain at ddiffyg dealltwriaeth a chamddealltwriaeth o redeg dwy system ochr yn ochr. Y peth pwysig yw ein bod yn symud drosodd at safonau, a bod hynny yn digwydd mor glou a phosibl. Rheswm arall dros hynny yw y bydd mwy o gysondeb, a bydd yn rhoi cyfle i'r cyrff hynny sy'n gorfod

Minister for education, who happens to be with us here this morning. What is your opinion, therefore, on the timetable that has been set by the Welsh Government now in relation to introducing standards, considering that the commission has been established for 18 months now?

Ms Huws: First, if I can take the opportunity to refer to the process that we went through during our first six months of existence, we decided to undertake a non-statutory consultation process on standards. The main reason for doing that was that, good or bad, standards are a regime unique to Wales, when you look at standards in terms of language. We looked across the world, and there is no map anywhere else to follow. So, the decision was that, in establishing the body, we needed to understand, and Wales needs to understand, the implications of standards. That was the purpose of that consultation: to create that understanding, and to create more awareness about what standards are in essence, and to offer the outcomes of that experience to the Government as a piece of advice under section 4. That was the purpose. I think there has been benefit to that exercise because, as we are discussing now with local government and seeing the timetable approaching, it understands better what standards are. We are not starting from a low base, and we are not starting from the very beginning; there is more awareness.

On the timetable, I am pleased to see it. We now know that, by 6 January, the Government will publish standards, and, on that day, the notices will be going out to the 26 bodies: the Welsh Government, local government and the national parks authorities. I believe there is then a need to move quite quickly to bring other bodies that are still working under Welsh language schemes over to a standards regime. I do not think we can maintain a situation in Wales that will lead to a lack of understanding and misunderstanding in having two systems running side by side. The important thing is to move over to standards, and to do that as quickly as possible. Another reason for that is that there will be more consistency, and it gives an opportunity for those bodies that have to comply with standards to share good

cydymffurfio â safonau i rannu arfer da a rhannu profiad.

[37] Mynegaf rywffaint o gonsŷrn nad yw byrddau iechyd yn rhan o'r criw cyntaf hwn, oherwydd bod cymaint o wasanaethau yn cael eu darparu ar y cyd gydag awdurdodau lleol, yn arbennig pan ydych yn edrych ar wasanaethau cymunedol. Bydd sefyllfa gennym lle, am gyfnod, bydd byrddau iechyd ac awdurdodau lleol yn gweithio mewn cyfundrefnau gwahanol o ran y Gymraeg. Y sialens i ni fydd sicrhau nad yw hynny'n andwyol i'r defnyddiwr. Rwy'n falch bod amserlen wedi'i gosod; mae'n bwysig ein bod yn glynu ati a bod y rhaglen dreigl y tu ôl i'r criw cyntaf hwn yn un cadarn a'n bod yn gallu rhoi sicrwydd i ddefnyddwyr, 'Dyma fydd yr amserlen, dyma y dylech chi fod yn ei ddisgwyl', ynghyd â'r un math o sicrwydd i ddarparwyr a phobl a fydd yn gweithio o fewn safonau.

[38] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** O ran cyflwyno'r safonau gyda chefnidir canlyniadau'r cyfrifiad diwethaf, a yw hynny'n golygu y dylem fod yn edrych ar y safonau hyn mewn ffordd wahanol? A ddylem edrych arnynt fel ffordd nid yn unig o ddiogelu'r hawl i ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg ond o fod yn llawer iawn mwy cadarnhaol, a cheisio hyrwyddo defnydd y Gymraeg gan sefydliadau yng Nghymru mewn ymateb i'r cyfrifiad? Rwy'n meddwl am sir Gaerfyrddin, lle y gellid dadlau bod canlyniadau'r cyfrifiad yn fwy difrifol nac mewn unrhyw le arall yng Nghymru. A ddylem fod yn edrych ar sut y gallwn greu sefyllfa o fewn Cyngor Sir Gaerfyrddin lle mae'r Gymraeg yn iaith weithredol weinyddol y mae pobl yn ei defnyddio o ddydd i ddydd, yn hytrach na bod popeth yn cael ei gyfieithu i'r Gymraeg fel rhyw fath o gydnybuddiaeth o'r Gymraeg?

[39] **Ms Huws:** Nid wyf wedi gweld y safonau drafft gan y Llywodraeth eto, ond byddwn yn cytuno gyda'r hyn yr ydych yn ei ddweud. Y perygl gyda safonau, fel y dywedais ar y dechrau, yw y bydd awdurdodau lleol a chyrrff eraill yn eu gweld fel rhywbeth biwrocraidd, a'u bod dim ond yn sicrhau eu bod yn cydymffurfio. Mae'n rhaid inni symud, byddwn i'n ei ddweud, o feddylfryd cydymffurfio pur i gydymffurfio

practice and to share experience.

I will express some concern that local health boards are not part of this first tranche, because so many services are provided jointly with local authorities, especially when you look at community services. We will have a situation where, for a period, health boards and local authorities will be working in different regimes in relation to the Welsh language. The challenge for us will be to ensure that that is not detrimental for the user. I am pleased that there is a timescale in place. It is important that we stick to it and that the rolling programme behind the first tranche is robust and that we can give assurance to users, 'This is what the timescale will be, this is what you should be expecting', along with the same sort of assurance for providers and people who will be working within standards.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: In terms of introducing the standards against the background of the results of the last census, does that mean that we should be looking at these standards in a different way? Should we be looking at standards as a way of not only safeguarding the right to use the Welsh language but of being much more proactive, trying to promote the use of the Welsh language by institutions in Wales in response to the census? I am thinking of Carmarthenshire, where it could be argued that the census results were more serious than in any other part of Wales. Should we now be looking at how we can create a situation within Carmarthenshire County Council where Welsh is an operational, administrative language that people use on a daily basis, rather than everything being translated into Welsh as some acknowledgement of the language?

Ms Huws: I have not seen the Government's draft standards yet, but I would agree with what you are saying. The danger with standards, as I said at the beginning, is that local authorities and other bodies will see them as being a bureaucratic exercise, and that they will just make sure that they comply. We have to move, I would say, from a mentality of pure compliance to compliance that leads to growth and increased use. I see

sy'n arwain at gynnydd a defnydd gwell. Rwy'n gweld y safonau, polisi a gweithredu mewnol yn ganolog i'r cam nesaf, a hefyd, wrth sôn am y 26, y safonau ynglŷn â hybu. Mae'n rhaid inni fod yn arloesol ac yn hyderus wrth ddefnyddio'r safonau hynny. Mae'n rhaid inni. Mae'n fwy na dim ond darparu gwasanaethau yn awr. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â symud tuag at sefyllfa lle'r ydym yn creu sefydliadau sydd yn gweithredu yn ddwyieithog, ac yn gwneud hynny'n naturiol ac yn hyderus. Mae hynny'n bwysig i'r gweithiwr a hefyd i ddefnyddwyr y gwasanaethau sy'n cael eu darparu gan y gweithwyr hynny. Rwy'n gobeithio na fydd safonau ddim ond yn arwain at broses fiwrocraidd, ond y byddant yn arwain at newid diwylliannol o ran y sefydliadau.

the standards, policy and internal operation as central to the next step and also, in mentioning the 26, the standards relating to promotion. We have to be innovative and confident in using those standards. We must be. This is about more than just providing services now. This is about moving to a situation whereby we create organisations that operate bilingually, and do so naturally and with confidence. That is important for the worker and also for the user of the services that are provided by those workers. I hope that standards do more than just lead to a bureaucratic process, but that they will lead to a cultural change in terms of the organisations.

[40] **Jenny Rathbone:** Bore da, mae gennyf ddau gwestiwn.

Jenny Rathbone: Good morning, I have two questions.

[41] First of all, there is an interesting graph on pages 28 and 29 of your report around the numbers of children assessed in Welsh at the end of the foundation phase and at the end of key stage 3. Perhaps I should declare that I am a governor at Ysgol Gynradd Gymraeg Pen-y-Groes here in Cardiff. I am surprised at the flatlining of the numbers assessed at the end of the foundation phase, simply because, certainly in Cardiff, there has been a very significant expansion of Welsh-medium education. I wonder whether you can explain what is going on. I would expect to see the graph going up, rather than just going along.

[42] **Ms Huws:** Mae hwn yn graff sydd wedi cael ei gynhyrchu gan Lywodraeth Cymru. I ddweud y gwir, mae'r hyn y mae'r graff yn ei ddangos yn siomedig. Rydym yn gwybod bod pocedi o gynnydd, ond nid yw'r sefyllfa yn gyson ar draws Cymru—mae pocedi o gynnydd mewn ardaloedd fel Caerdydd ac yn Wrecsam hefyd, ond nid yw hynny'n gyson. Mae hwn wedi cael ei dynnu o waith y Llywodraeth.

Ms Huws: This is a graph that has been produced by the Welsh Government. To be honest, what is shown in the graph is disappointing. We know that there are pockets of growth, but it is not a consistent situation across Wales—there are pockets of growth in areas such as Cardiff, and in Wrexham as well, but that is not consistent. This has been drawn from the work of the Government.

[43] **Jenny Rathbone:** Okay, but it seems to indicate that, in other parts of the country, there has been a reduction in Welsh-medium education. Obviously, the Member on my left will have much experience of all this.

[44] The second issue that I wanted to raise with you was the investigations that you have done. On pages 40 and 41, it says that you did an investigation into Betsi Cadwaladr University Local Health Board because it had advertised for new chaplains with Welsh language as a 'desirable' requirement in the person specification. Could you explain to us why that became the subject of an investigation?

[45] **Ms Huws:** Gallaf. Mae hwn yn ymchwiliad a etifeddwyd o gyfnod Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg, ac roedd yn seiliedig ar gŵyn a dderbyniwyd gan aelod o'r cyhoedd am

Ms Huws: Yes, I can explain. This is an investigation that was inherited from the Welsh Language Board, and it was based on a complaint made by a member of the public

ddarpariaeth yn y bwrdd iechyd hwn. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r ymchwiliadau o dan adran 17 Deddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993 yn deillio o gŵyn gan unigolyn neu gan grŵp o unigolion. Un peth sy'n wir am swyddfa'r comisiynydd yw bod gennym system i ddelio â chwynion. Yn y flwyddyn gyntaf, rydym wedi delio â bron i 500 o gŵynion oddi wrth unigolion ynglŷn â diffyg darpariaethau, ond hefyd o ran honiadau bod cyrff a oedd â chynllun iaith wedi torri'r cynlluniau hynny. Dyna a ddigwyddodd gyda Betsi Cadwaladr. Derbyniodd y corff blaenorol gŵyn oddi wrth unigolyn—neu, os wyf yn cofio yn iawn, gyfres o unigolion—ynglŷn â'r diffyg darpariaeth hwn, a'r amheuaeth nad oedd Betsi Cadwaladr wedi gweithredu o fewn ei gynllun iaith. Dyna oedd ein casgliad ni hefyd.

about provision at this health board. Most of the investigations under section 17 of the Welsh Language Act 1993 stem from a complaint made by an individual or by a group of individuals. One thing that is true about the office of the commissioner is that we have a system for dealing with complaints. During the first year, we dealt with around 500 complaints from individuals relating to the lack of provision, but there were also claims that bodies that had a language scheme had broken those schemes. That is what had happened at Betsi Cadwaladr. The previous body received a complaint from an individual—or, if I remember rightly, a series of individuals—about this lack of provision and the suspicion that Betsi Cadwaladr had not worked within its language scheme. That was our conclusion, too.

[46] Mae hyn wedi arwain at ymateb positif o ran y bwrdd iechyd, fel sy'n arfer digwydd ar ddiwedd ymchwiliad. Rydym yn gweld gan amlaf fod cyrff sy'n mynd drwy broses ymchwiliad statudol yn awyddus iawn wedyn i weithredu'r argymhellion ac i weithio gyda ni i sicrhau nad oes diffyg yn y dyfodol.

This has led to a positive response from the health board, which is what usually happens at the end of an investigation. We mostly find that bodies that have gone through a statutory inquiry process are very keen afterwards to implement recommendations and work with us to ensure that there are no further problems.

[47] **Jenny Rathbone:** Betsi Cadwaladr's language scheme says that its recruitment, obviously, will be bilingually distributed and publicised, but that the ability to speak Welsh may be 'desirable' or 'essential'. So, why in this specific case was it not deemed appropriate for this post to be advertised with Welsh as 'desirable'? Obviously, there are other essential requirements that are very important, too—empathy, listening skills et cetera.

[48] **Ms Huws:** Os wyf yn cofio yn iawn—cewch fanylion llawn yr ymchwiliad ar ein safle gwe; mae'r adroddiad llawn yno—yr hyn yr oedd Betsi Cadwaladr wedi ei ddatgan yn ei gynllun iaith oedd y byddai'n edrych ar hanfodion sgiliau ym mhob swydd, ac yn mynd drwy broses o adnabod yr hanfodion hynny. Roedd teimlad nad oedd y bwrdd iechyd, yn y broses hon, wedi gwneud hynny mewn modd derbyniol a'i fod felly wedi torri ei gynllun iaith ei hun wrth ddelio â'r swydd-ddisgrifiad. Nid oedd wedi gweithredu y tu mewn i'r hyn yr oedd wedi gosod arno ef ei hunan yn ddisgwyliad yn ei gynllun iaith.

Ms Huws: If I remember correctly—you can find full details of the inquiry on our website; the full report is there—what Betsi Cadwaladr had stated in its language scheme was that it would look at the required skills for every role and go through a process of recognising those requirements. There was a feeling that the health board, in this process, had not done that in an acceptable manner and had therefore broken the requirements of its own language scheme in dealing with this job description. It had not operated within what it had placed on itself as an expectation in its language scheme.

[49] **Jenny Rathbone:** So, it was because it had not adequately decided whether or not this should be a desirable requirement.

- [50] **Christine Chapman:** It is on the website, you say, so we can look at that.
- [51] **Ms Huws:** Mae pob adroddiad **Ms Huws:** The full report for every ymchwiliad yn llawn ar ein safle gwe ni. investigation is on our website.
- [52] **Christine Chapman:** Jenny, do you have anything else?
- [53] **Jenny Rathbone:** No, that is fine, thanks.
- [54] **Lindsay Whittle:** Beth ydych yn ei **Lindsay Whittle:** What are you doing to wneud i helpu pobl ifanc i siarad Cymraeg yn help young people to speak Welsh socially in gymdeithasol yn y Cymoedd? the Valleys?
- [55] I am going to repeat it in English, because I am not sure whether I made a mistake; but if I did, I do not care.
- [56] **Ms Huws:** Naddo, wnaethost ti **Ms Huws:** No, you did not. ddim.
- [57] **Lindsay Whittle:** All right, then. What about after they have left school as well?
- [58] **Ms Huws:** Dechreuaf yr ateb a throi **Ms Huws:** I will start the answer and I will at Gwyn wedyn i godi'r cam nesaf yn yr ateb. then turn to Gwyn to pick up the next stage of the answer.
- [59] Rydym yn ymwybodol iawn bod llwyddiannau sylweddol o ran pobl ifanc yn datblygu sgiliau yn y system addysg, ac yn sicr yn yr ardaloedd rydych chi'n eu cynrychioli, rydym wedi gweld newid sylweddol ar lawr gwlad. Nid oes cwestiwn am hynny. Yr hyn nad ydym yn ei weld, fel y soniais i yn gynharach, yw'r dilyniant hwnnw drwodd i'r iaith ddod yn iaith gwaith nac ychwaith yn iaith cyfathrebu y tu allan i'r ysgol. Mae sialens, a chredaf fod yn rhaid inni dderbyn bod sialens fawr, oherwydd rydym yn byw mewn byd lle mae'r iaith Saesneg, gan amlaf, yn teyrnasu o ran technoleg gwybodaeth a rhwydweithio cymdeithasol. Felly, mae sialens. We are very aware of the fact that there have been significant successes in young people's development of skills in the education system, and, certainly in the areas that you represent, we have seen a substantial change on the ground. There is no question about that. What we do not then see, as I mentioned earlier, is progression, with the language becoming a language of the workplace or even a language of communication outside school. There is a challenge, and I believe that we have to accept that there is a major challenge, because we live in a world where the English language, more often than not, predominates in information technology and social networking. So, there is a challenge.
- 11:30
- [60] Rydym wedi bod yn gwneud sawl peth. Rydym yn gweithio gyda cholegau addysg bellach a chyflogwyr i geisio sefydlu'r Gymraeg fel sgil gwaith o fewn y gweithle. Yn ddiweddar iawn, roeddwn yn annerch 129 o bobl ifanc a oedd yn astudio ar gyfer BTEC iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn Nhrehafod—wel, nid oeddent i gyd yn astudio yn Nhrehafod, ond yn Nhrehafod y cwrddais â nhw—yn y de-ddwyrain. Roedd 128 o We have been doing several things. We are working with further education colleges and employers to try to establish Welsh as a skill for the workplace. Very recently, I addressed 129 young people who were studying for a BTEC in health and social care through the medium of Welsh in Trehafod—well, they were not all studying in Trehafod, but I met them in Trehafod—in the south-east. There were 128 girls and one young man, but there were 129 people who have the ability to be

ferched ac un dyn bach, ond 129 o bobl sydd â'r gallu i fod yn weithwyr dwyieithog yn y byd iechyd a gofal. Roedd y brwdfrydedd yn yr ystafell honno yn wych. Felly, mae'r gwaith hwnnw'n bwysig.

bilingual workers in the field of health and care. The enthusiasm in that room was fantastic. Therefore, that work is important.

[61] Rydym hefyd yn gweithio gyda'r trydydd sector ym maes chwaraeon. Gwyn, a hoffet ti sôn am yr hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud gyda'r trydydd sector o ran chwaraeon a mudiadau eraill?

We also work with the third sector in relation to sports. Gwyn, would you like to pick up on what we have done with the third sector in terms of sports and other societies?

[62] **Mr Williams:** Yn gyntaf, gwaith uned Gymraeg y Llywodraeth yw'r gwaith o hybu ar lawr gwlad mewn cymunedau; gwaith rheoleiddio, gwneud awgrymiadau a rhoi cyngor yw rôl y comisiynydd. Yn sicr, yn ddiweddar, rydym wedi cwrdd â chyrrff chwaraeon gan weld chwaraeon fel un ffordd o ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg. Mae llawer iawn o gyrff chwaraeon yn awyddus iawn i hyrwyddo'r Gymraeg ac i hyfforddi drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, ond yn amlwg, ni allant wneud hynny os nad yw'r hyfforddwyr priodol ar gael.

Mr Williams: First, it is the work of the Government's Welsh language unit to undertake promotion work with communities at a grass-roots level; the role of the commissioner is to regulate, make suggestions and to offer advice. Certainly, recently, we have met sports bodies, as sport is one way of using the Welsh language. A number of sports bodies are very keen to promote Welsh and to train through the medium of Welsh, but obviously they can do that only if the appropriate coaches are available.

[63] Tua chwe wythnos yn ôl, gwnaethom gwrdd â chyrrff fel Clybiau Bechgyn a Merched Cymru a Sgowntiaid Cymru. Un o'r problemau a oedd ganddynt oedd, er eu bod am wneud pethau drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, nid oedd ganddynt y gwirfoddolwyr. Fel arfer, mae gwirfoddolwyr ar gyfer cyrrff fel hynny yn rhieni, ond y broblem oedd nad oedd y rhieni Cymraeg ar gael oherwydd nad oedd plant Cymraeg eu hiaith yn rhan o'r sgowntiaid neu'r clybiau bechgyn a merched. Felly, roeddent mewn cylch dieflig, braidd. Mae angen torri hynny a gweithio gyda chyrrff fel yr Urdd. Ar hyn o bryd, roedd y clybiau bechgyn a merched yn dweud eu bod yn cyfeirio pobl sydd am wneud chwaraeon drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg at yr Urdd, ond rydym am ehangu hynny a gweithio gyda'r Urdd a'r clybiau bechgyn a merched a'r sgowntiaid i ehangu'r rhwyd hwnnw.

Some six weeks ago, we met organisations such as Boys and Girls Clubs of Wales and Scouts Wales. One problems that they have is that, even though they are keen to do things through the medium of Welsh, they do not have the volunteers to do so. Usually, it is parents who volunteer in such organisations, but the problem was that the Welsh-speaking parents were not available because the Welsh-speaking children were not a part of the scouts or the boys' and girls' clubs. So, they were in a bit of a vicious cycle. That needs to be broken and there needs to be joint working with organisations such as the Urdd. At the moment, the boys' and girls' clubs said that they refer people who want to play sport through the medium of Welsh to the Urdd, but we want to expand on that and collaborate with the Urdd and the boys' and girls' clubs and the scouts to broaden that network.

[64] **Lindsay Whittle:** Diolch am eich atebion ar y cwestiynau ar addysg.

Lindsay Whittle: Thank you for your answers on the questions on education.

[65] I will have to ask my final question in English, because it has been prepared by my researchers. In the commissioner's view, how effective is the Social Services and Well-being (Wales) Bill in ensuring that patients whose first language is Welsh are able to communicate in the Welsh language with health, care and social care staff? My colleague Elin Jones was

questioning the Deputy Minister for Social Services only yesterday in our Health and Social Care Committee session on the new Bill.

[66] **Ms Huws:** Yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf, mae'r Bil Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a Llesiant (Cymru) yn un o'r Biliau yr wyf wedi eu hystyried yn benodol fel comisiynydd. Mae'n ddarn eithriadol o bwysig o ddeddfwriaeth—a soniaf am yr ymholiad iechyd mewn munud. Roeddwn yn siomedig iawn pan welais y Bil nad oedd cyfeiriad at y Gymraeg ar wyneb y Bil. Rydym yn teimlo ei bod yn hollbwysig bod cyfeiriad at y Gymraeg i'w weld ar wyneb Biliau. Y rheswm am hynny yw profiad diweddar. Cyn cyfnod y comisiynydd, drafftwyd a phasiwyd Mesur yn ymwneud ag iechyd meddwl—darn o ddeddfwriaeth yng Nghymru ynglŷn ag iechyd meddwl. Yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw, bu trafodaeth ynglŷn â gosod y Gymraeg ar wyneb y Bil hwnnw. Penderfynwyd nad oedd hynny'n briodol, a bod modd delio â'r Gymraeg drwy reoliadau, canllawiau a chod ymarfer. Mae ymarferwyr wedi dod ataf yn ddiweddar a dweud, wrth i'r Bil gael ei adolygu a'i ail-hystyried, eu bod yn codi materion ynglŷn â'r diffyg darpariaeth ynglŷn â'r Gymraeg.

Ms Huws: Over recent months, the Social Services and Well-being (Wales) Bill is one of the Bills that I have given specific consideration to as commissioner. It is an extremely important piece of legislation—and I will talk about the health inquiry in a moment. I was very disappointed when I saw the Bill that there was no reference to the Welsh language on the face of the Bill. We feel that it is vital that there is a visible reference to the Welsh language on the face of Bills. The reason for that is recent experience. Before the post of commissioner was created, a Measure in relation to mental health was drafted and passed—a piece of legislation in Wales relating to mental health. During that period, there was discussion about placing a reference to the Welsh language on the face of that Bill. It was decided that that was not appropriate, and that it was possible to deal with Welsh through regulations, guidelines and a code of practice. Practitioners have come to me recently to say that, as the Bill has been reviewed and reconsidered, they have been raising matters relating to the lack of provision in relation to the Welsh language.

[67] Yr ymateb sydd wedi bod yw, 'Sori, allwn ni ddim trafod hynny achos does dim cyfeiriad at y Gymraeg ar wyneb y Bil, felly allwn ni ddim adolygu rhywbeth sydd ddim yno.' Felly, mae'n bwysig iawn ein bod yn ystyried, mewn modd rhesymol, lle dylid sicrhau bod y Gymraeg yn weladwy. Byddwn yn dweud bod y Bil gofal cymdeithasol yn un o'r darnau pwysicaf o ddeddfwriaeth o ran profiad pobl yng Nghymru a'u hangen gwirioneddol—nid dewis ydyw—i allu cyfathrebu yn yr iaith y maent yn ei dewis, neu, yn aml iawn, efallai yn yr unig iaith y maent yn medru ei defnyddio oherwydd salwch, neu jest oherwydd eu bod o dan bwysau ac yn poeni am eu sefyllfa. Felly, o ran esiampl o le mae'n bwysig inni gydnabod y ddwy iaith yng Nghymru, dyna yw'r Bil sy'n eithriadol o bwysig. Gallwn symud ymlaen yn y dyfodol i edrych ar y Bil cynllunio a Biliau eraill, ond mae'r Bil hwn yn ymwneud â bywyd pobl.

The response that has been is, 'Sorry, we can't discuss that because there is no reference to the Welsh language on the face of the Bill, so we cannot review something that is not there.' Therefore, it is very important that we consider, in a reasonable manner, where we should ensure that the Welsh language is visible. I would say that this social care Bill is one of the most important pieces of legislation in terms of people's experiences in Wales and their real need—it is not a choice—to be able to communicate in their language of choice, or, quite often, perhaps in the only language that they can use because of illness, or just because they are under stress and are concerned about their situation. So, in terms of an example of where it is important to recognise the two languages in Wales, that is the vital Bill. We can move on in the future to look at the planning Bill and other Bills, but this Bill relates to people's lives.

[68] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Hoffwn ofyn

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I would like to ask

cwestiwn i chi am y secondiad i Swyddfa Cymru, oherwydd mae problem hanesyddol wedi bod o ran cael adrannau Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig i gydymffurfio â gofynion yn y Gymraeg. Beth mae'r secondiad hwn i fod i'w gyflawni?

[69] **Ms Huws:** Yn fras, y sefyllfa ar hyn o bryd, o dan Ddeddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993, yw bod 39 adran yn San Steffan gyda chynllun iaith ac yn gweithredu o fewn y cynllun hwnnw. Maent yn gweithredu mewn gwahanol ffyrdd o fewn y cynllun iaith, ond maent yn gweithredu o fewn cyfundrefn cynlluniau iaith. Pan ddaw safonau i rym a phan ddaw Mesur y Gymraeg (Cymru) 2011 i'w llawn weithrediad, bydd posibilrwydd gosod safonau ar adrannau San Steffan drwy gydsyniad Swyddfa Cymru ac Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru.

[70] Mae pwrpas y secondiad yn ddeublyg. Yn gyntaf, ei bwrpas yw sicrhau nad oes camu'n ôl o ran defnydd adrannau San Steffan o'r Gymraeg a'u gweithrediad o fewn cynlluniau iaith. Rwy'n credu ei fod yn deg dweud, hyd yn oed yn ystod yr 20 mis diwethaf, ein bod wedi gweld gwahanol adrannau yn camu'n ôl ac efallai yn anghofio am fodolaeth yr iaith Gymraeg. Rydym wedi gweld hynny, yn anffodus, o gwmpas datblygiadau gov.uk, a hefyd wrth drafod *universal credits* a'r gweithdrefnau sydd yn awr yn galluogi teuluoedd i dderbyn taliadau o ran plant, sef yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd oddi ar y *Child Support Agency*. Nid wyf yn credu mai cynllwyn ydyw—rwy'n gobeithio nad cynllwyn ydyw—ond mae'r Gymraeg yn diflannu o'u hystyriaethau hwy, ac rydym yn gorfod gweithio i roi'r Gymraeg yn ôl i mewn i'w hystyriaethau. Felly, rhan o bwrpas y secondiad yw sicrhau nad yw'r llithro hwnnw yn digwydd.

[71] Yr ail bwrpas yw cynnal awdit o'r hyn sydd yn digwydd yn San Steffan, a'r gwasanaethau sy'n cael eu darparu. Maent yn wasanaethau pwysig i ni fel Cymry—maent yn wasanaethau cyfiawnder ac maent yn wasanaethau sy'n ymwneud â budd-daliadau. Nid ydynt yn wasanaethau ymylol—maent yn wasanaethau sy'n ganolog i fywydau pobl, ac mae'n bwysig nad oes llithro. Rydym hefyd yn gobeithio y bydd yn paratoi'r tir i

you a question in relation to the secondment to the Wales Office, because there has been a historical problem in terms of getting UK Government departments to comply with requirements in the Welsh language. What is this secondment meant to achieve?

Ms Huws: Broadly, the situation at the moment, under the Welsh Language Act 1993, is that 39 Westminster departments have a language scheme and operate within that scheme. They operate in different ways within a language scheme, but they are operating within a language scheme regime. When standards come into force and when the Welsh Language Measure (Wales) 2011 comes into its full implementation, there will be a possibility of imposing standards on Westminster departments through the consent of the Wales Office and the Secretary of State for Wales.

The purpose of the secondment is twofold. First, to ensure that there is no stepping back in terms of Westminster departments' use of the Welsh language and their operation within language schemes. I think that it is fair to say, even in the past 20 months, that we have seen different departments stepping back and perhaps forgetting about the existence of the Welsh language. We have seen that, unfortunately, in relation to developments regarding gov.uk and in terms of the procedures that now enable families to receive payments in relation to children, which is what has happened since the Child Support Agency. I do not think that it is a conspiracy—I hope it is not a conspiracy—but the Welsh language is disappearing from their considerations, and we have to work to put the Welsh language back into their considerations. So, the secondment is partly to ensure that that slipping back does not happen.

The second purpose is to undertake an audit of what is happening in Westminster, and the services that are provided. They are important services for us in Wales—they are justice services and they are services to do with benefits. They are not peripheral services—they are central to people's lives, and it is important that there is no slippage. We also hope that it will prepare the way to standards being imposed on Westminster

osod safonau ar adrannau San Steffan, gan weithio gyda Swyddfa Cymru i sicrhau hynny.

[72] Wrth gwrs, ni allwn ragdybio beth fydd penderfyniad Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ar y mater hwnnw, ond bydd hyn yn sicrhau ein bod yn cadw llygad barcud ar y gwasanaethau hynny sydd yn dal i ddeillio o San Steffan, oherwydd mae'n rhwydd iawn i'r Gymraeg fynd yn angof.

[73] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I symud at y cwynion rydych yn eu derbyn fel comisiwn a'r angen i ymchwilio i'r cwynion hynny, a ydych yn gallu rhoi rhywfaint o wybodaeth i ni ynglŷn â natur y cwynion hynny? Beth yw'r themâu sydd yn codi'n gyson o ran y cwynion hyn?

[74] **Ms Huws:** Gallaf. O edrych ar y ffigurau ar gyfer cwynion y llynedd, sydd i'w gweld yn yr adroddiad blynyddol, fe welwch fod 468 o gwynion wedi dod i mewn. Roedd 213 o'r rheini yn gwynion ynglŷn â sefydliadau cyhoeddus. I roi blas i chi o ba sectorau y daethant, o'r 213, roedd 80 ohonynt ynglŷn ag awdurdodau lleol; 30 ynglŷn â darpariaeth Llywodraeth Cymru; 15 ynglŷn â sefydliadau addysg; 10 ynglŷn â chyfiawnder; a 30 ynglŷn ag iechyd. Yn syml, diffyg darpariaeth ydyw, oherwydd, yn aml, lle mae cynllun iaith sy'n dweud y bydd darpariaeth, nid yw'r ddarpariaeth honno yno. Diffyg darpariaeth ydyw ar y cyfan. Ansawdd y ddarpariaeth ydyw weithiau, ond diffyg darpariaeth yw'r prif fater rydym yn ei ddelio ag ef.

[75] Mae'r ail set o faterion yn rhywbeth yr ydym wedi cyfeirio ato'n barod, sef y ffaith nad yw cyrff sydd â chynlluniau iaith a chanllawiau pendant o ran apwyntio ac asesu anghenion sgiliau mewn swyddi yn gweithredu o fewn yr hyn maent yn ei ddatgan yn eu cynlluniau iaith. Felly, nid ydynt yn glynu at yr hyn y maent wedi ei ddweud wrth iddynt bennu swydd-ddisgrifiadau ac anghenion ieithyddol gwahanol swyddi.

[76] Felly, mae'r cwynion ynghylch diffyg darpariaeth a diffygion o ran recriwtio a sicrhau gweithlu.

departments, working with the Wales Office to ensure that.

Of course, we cannot foresee what the Secretary of State for Wales's decision on that matter will be, but this will ensure that we keep a detailed eye on those services that still emanate from Westminster, because it is very easy for the Welsh language to be forgotten.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Moving on to complaints that you receive as a commission and the need to investigate those complaints, can you give us some information on the nature of those complaints? What are the themes that frequently arise in terms of these complaints?

Ms Huws: Yes, I can. Looking at last year's complaints, which are included in the annual report, you will see that 468 complaints came in. Of those complaints, 213 related to public bodies. To give you a taste of what sectors they came from, of the 213, 80 of the complaints related to local authorities; 30 related to Welsh Government provision; 15 related to education establishments; 10 related to justice; and 30 to health. It is simply a lack of provision, because, quite often, where there is a language scheme that says that there will be provision, that provision does not exist. It is about the lack of provision on the whole. It is sometimes the quality of provision, but lack of provision is the main issue that we deal with.

The second set of issues is something that we have referred to already, which is the fact that bodies that have language schemes and definite guidelines about appointments and assessing the skills needs of posts do not operate in the way that they state in their language schemes. So, they are not sticking to what they have said as they decide on job descriptions and the different linguistic needs of posts.

So, the complaints are about a lack of provision and weaknesses in recruiting and the workforce.

[77] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Y tu mewn i'r sector cyhoeddus, a'r cwmnïau hynny yn y sector preifat sy'n dod o dan Fesur y Gymraeg, mae'ch dull chi o weithredu yn weddol syml. Hynny yw, mae canllawiau penodol iddo, ac mae cyd-destun y gallwch weithio ynddo. Fodd bynnag, rydych chi hefyd yn derbyn cwynion gan bobl sy'n teimlo nad ydynt wedi cael y cyfle i ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg o fewn y sector preifat, mewn cwmnïau nad ydynt yn dod o dan y Mesur. Mae achos cyfredol gyda chwmni yswiriant, ac roedd achos blaenorol gyda chwmni yswiriant, pan oedd rhywun a oedd yn gallu siarad Cymraeg—os credaf yr hanes a gafodd ei gofnodi gan y gwasanaeth newyddion—wedi gorfod dweud wrth berson a oedd yn defnyddio'r Gymraeg, 'Er fy mod i'n gallu siarad Cymraeg, ni allaf ei defnyddio, oherwydd mae'r sgwrs yma'n cael ei recordio, ac mae'r cwmni'n dweud, oherwydd hynny, nad oes modd defnyddio'r Gymraeg.'

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Within the public sector, and those companies in the private sector that come under the Welsh language Measure, your means of operating are relatively simple. That is, there are set guidelines to it, and there is a context within which you can work. However, you also receive complaints from people who feel that they have not had an opportunity to use the Welsh language within the private sector, in companies that do not fall under the Measure. There is an ongoing case with an insurance company, and there was a previous case with an insurance company, where someone who could speak Welsh—if I believe the story that was noted by the news service—had to tell somebody who wanted to use the Welsh language, 'Even though I can speak Welsh, I can't use it, because this conversation is being recorded and the company says that, because of that, I can't use the Welsh language'.

[78] Mae'n ymddangos i mi fod hynny'n ymateb cwbl afresymol. Os yw rhywun yn medru cynnal sgwrs yn y Gymraeg, 'does bosib fod modd canfod rhywun o fewn y cwmni, neu hyd yn oed cael rhywun o'r tu allan, i wrando ar yr hyn sydd wedi ei recordio. Beth mae'r comisiwn yn gallu ei wneud mewn sefyllfa o'r fath, oherwydd nid yw mor rhwydd â hynny?

It appears to me that that is an unreasonable response. If somebody can hold a discussion through the medium of Welsh, then surely you can find someone within the company, or even somebody outwith the company, to listen to what has been recorded. What can the commission do in a situation like that, because it is not as easy as that?

[79] **Ms Huws:** Na.

Ms Huws: No.

[80] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae'n gwestiwn o beth sy'n rhesymol ac yn ymarferol o ran ein disgwyliadau ni, fel siaradwyr Cymraeg, i allu defnyddio'r Gymraeg yn gyffredinol yng Nghymru.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: This is a question of what is reasonable and practical in terms of our expectations, as Welsh speakers, to be able to use the Welsh language in general in Wales.

[81] **Ms Huws:** Hoffwn ddechrau trwy ddweud nad wyf am wneud sylw ynglŷn â'r achosion posibl sydd wedi cael eu cyfeirio atynt gan y gwasanaethau newyddion. Efallai eu bod yn faterion sydd o dan sylw, neu'n cael eu hystyried gennym ni o dan y Mesur ar hyn o bryd. Felly, maddeuwch imi, nid wyf yn mynd i wneud sylw am yr achosion hynny; ni fyddai hynny'n briodol.

Ms Huws: I want to start by saying that I do not want to comment on the possible cases that have been referred to by the news services. They are perhaps matters that are under review, or matters that are being considered by us under the Measure. Therefore, forgive me, I will not be making a comment on those cases; it would not be appropriate.

[82] Fel rydych chi'n gwybod, mae adran 111 o Fesur y Gymraeg (Cymru) 2011 yn caniatáu i unigolyn sy'n teimlo bod

As you know, section 111 of the Welsh Language (Wales) Measure 2011 allows an individual who feels that there has been

ymyrraeth wedi bod ar ei ryddid ef neu ei rhyddid hi i gyfathrebu â rhywun arall trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg i gyfeirio'r achos atom ni. Mae hynny'n deillio o achos a gododd flynyddoedd yn ôl, achos a gafodd ei adnabod fel 'achos Thomas Cook' ac a gafodd ei gyfeirio at y corff hawliau dynol.

interference on his or her freedom to communicate with somebody else through the medium of Welsh to refer their case to us. That stems from a case that arose years ago, a case that was known as 'the Thomas Cook case' and was referred to the human rights body.

[83] Mae adran 111 yn gyfle; mae'n ddarn o gyfraith hefyd. Bydd yn rhaid inni fod yn ofalus iawn wrth ei ddefnyddio, oherwydd rydym eisiau symud at sefyllfa lle gallwn, o'i ddefnyddio, gael gwell dealltwriaeth ynglŷn â beth yw'n hawliau i ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg. Nid ydym wedi ei ddefnyddio eto, achos nid yw'r sefyllfa wedi codi, ond mae'n bosibl y byddwn ni'n ei ddefnyddio yn ystod y cyfnod nesaf.

Section 111 is an opportunity; it is also a piece of legislation. We will have to be very careful in using it, because we want to move to a situation where, from using it, we gain a better understanding of the rights relating to the use of the Welsh language. We have not used it yet, because the situation has not arisen, but there is a possibility that we will use it in the next stage.

[84] Felly, yr hyn y gallaf ei ddweud yw hyn: mae posibilrwydd yn y Mesur, ac rydym yn ymwybodol o'r cyfle i'w ddefnyddio, ond mae'n rhaid ei ddefnyddio mewn modd cadarn ac mewn modd sy'n arwain at ddealltwriaeth well. Nid yw, ar hyn o bryd—na, dyna'r gorau y gallaf ei ddweud. Mae yn y Mesur, ac mae'n rhaid inni ei ddefnyddio mewn modd sy'n ddefnyddiol a fydd yn arwain at newid a dealltwriaeth well.

Therefore, what I can say is this: there is a possibility in the Measure, and we are aware of the opportunity to use it, but we have to use it in a robust way and in a way that leads to a better understanding. It is not, at the moment—no, that is the best that I can say. It is within the Measure, we have to use it in a useful way that will lead to change and a better understanding.

11:45

[85] **Mr Williams:** Yn sgîl y sylw a gafodd yr achos blaenorol y cyfeirioch ato, sef achos yswiriant Admiral, cwrddodd y comisiynydd, minnau a swyddog ag Admiral. Roedd peth camddealltwriaeth, ond mae rheoleiddiwr y gwasanaethau ariannol yn hollol fodlon yn awr i dderbyn recordiad o sgwrs yn Gymraeg. Yr unig beth sy'n bwysig iddo ef yw bod y sgwrs wedi'i recordio. Mae Admiral yn derbyn hynny, ac yn dweud y byddai'n ddigon hapus i rywun drafod dros y ffôn yn y Gymraeg. Fodd bynnag, dywedodd wedyn mai isel yw'r tebygrwydd y dewch chi o hyd i siaradwr Cymraeg, ac ni all warantu y gellid cynnal y drafodaeth. Mae hynny'n amlwg yn ymateb pur siomedig. Ers hynny, mae wedi cynnal awdit o'i staff er mwyn adnabod pwy sy'n gallu siarad Cymraeg yn eu mysg a sut y gall gynllunio trefn fel y caiff rhywun gynnal ei fusnes gyda'r cwmni drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg.

Mr Williams: Given the attention that was given to the previous case that you referred to, namely the Admiral insurance case, the commissioner, an official and I met with Admiral. There was some misunderstanding, but the financial services regulator is now willing to accept a recording of a discussion in Welsh. The only thing that matters is that the discussion has been recorded. Admiral accepts that, and it says that it would be happy enough for people to communicate with its staff over the phone in Welsh. However, it then said that the likelihood of finding a Welsh speaker was low, and it cannot guarantee that people will be able to use the Welsh language. That was clearly a disappointing response. Since then, it has undertaken an audit of its staff to identify who among them can speak Welsh and to identify how they can plan so that people can conduct their business with the company through the medium of Welsh.

[86] **Ms Huws:** Mae hefyd wedi penodi, neu roi swyddogaeth, pencampwr dros y Gymraeg i un o'r uwch dîm. Felly, mae camu ymlaen wedi bod o ran y sefyllfa honno.

Ms Huws: It has also appointed a member of the senior management team as, or created the role of, its Welsh language champion. So, gains have been made in terms of that situation.

[87] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yn amlwg, rwy'n croesawu hynny'n fawr iawn. Mae'n dda iawn gweld Admiral yn gweithredu mewn ffordd gadarnhaol yn hyn o beth. Er hynny, mae sefyllfa lle mae'n hawdd iawn i gwmnïau ddweud, 'Na, nid ydym yn gallu canfod neb sy'n gallu gweithredu yn y Gymraeg yn y sefyllfa hon.' Yn gyffredinol, byddwn i'n dadlau bod hynny yn ymateb annigonol ar ran cwmni, a byddwn yn teimlo y dylid dweud wrth y cwmni hwnnw, 'Wel, rydych yn ymwneud â phobl mewn gwlad ddwyieithog, gyda lleiafrif yn siarad y Gymraeg ac yn dymuno ei defnyddio, ac mae cyfrifoldeb arnoch i geisio gwneud yr hyn sy'n ymarferol bosibl i ymateb i'r alwad honno.' A oes ffordd y gall y comisiwn weithredu, heblaw am ofyn yn neis i'r cwmni wneud hynny?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Clearly, I welcome that very much. It is very good to see Admiral operating in a positive manner in this regard. Nevertheless, there is a situation where it is very easy for companies to say, 'No, we can't find anyone who can work through the medium of Welsh in this situation.' In general, I would argue that that is an insufficient response for a company to make, and I would feel that we would have to say to that company, 'Well, you deal with people in a bilingual country, where a minority speak, and wish to use, the Welsh language, and you have a responsibility to try to do what is practically possible to respond to the demand.' Is there some way in which the commission can operate, other than to ask the company nicely to do that?

[88] **Mr Williams:** Yn sicr, mae'n rhywbeth yr ydym yn ei gael yn gyson yn ein hymwneud â'r sector preifat, lle mae rheolwyr yn dweud wrthym, 'Rydym yn methu â chael staff; rydym yn methu â chael siaradwyr Cymraeg.' Mae Trenau Arriva Cymru wedi dweud wrthym ei fod wedi hysbysebu swyddi, gan nodi bod y Gymraeg yn ddymunol, ac wedi methu â chael staff Cymraeg. Mae'n gofyn y cwestiwn hwn: os yw'r holl bobl ifanc hyn yn gadael yr ysgol â chymhwyster yn y Gymraeg, pam nad ydynt yn dod drwodd i'r gweithle? Rwy'n meddwl mai honno yw'r her i'r comisiynydd edrych arni a'i hadolygu a'i rheoleiddio. Fodd bynnag, o ran addysg ac addysg bellach, sut ydym yn gallu trosi'r bobl ifanc hynny sy'n gadael yr ysgol â chymwysterau yn y Gymraeg i fod yn aelodau gwerthfawr o'r gweithlu?

Mr Williams: Certainly, it is something that we hear consistently in our dealings with the private sector, where managers tell us, 'We can't find staff; we can't get Welsh-speaking staff.' Arriva Trains Wales has told us that it has advertised posts, noting Welsh as desirable, and has not be able to get Welsh-speaking staff. It is asking this question: if all these young people are leaving school with qualifications in the Welsh language, why are they not coming through to the workplace? I think that that is the challenge for the commissioner to look at and review and regulate. However, in terms of education and further education, how can we turn these young people who leave school with Welsh-language qualifications into valued members of the workforce?

[89] **Leighton Andrews:** Bore da. Beth yw eich barn chi am y modd cyffredinol y mae'r Llywodraeth yn integreiddio ystyriaeth o'r Gymraeg i'w phrosesu gweithio?

Leighton Andrews: Good morning. What is your opinion of the general way in which the Government integrates the consideration of the Welsh language into its work processes?

[90] **Ms Huws:** Mae hynny'n ddiddorol iawn. Rwy'n mynd i ateb hyn mewn dwy ffordd. Byddaf yn edrych yn gyntaf ar y

Ms Huws: That is very interesting. I am going to answer that in two ways. I am going to look first at the way in which you make

ffordd yr ydych yn gwneud penderfyniadau polisi fel Llywodraeth, ac rwy'n credu bod hynny'n rhywbeth sy'n codi yn ein hadroddiad blynyddol, sef pa mor bwysig ydyw ein bod yn gweld y Gymraeg yn ganolog yn ystyriaethau polisi, a gwneud hynny gan ddefnyddio methodoleg gadarn a all arwain at newid. Rwyf wedi sôn am y Bil gofal cymdeithasol a llesiant, ac am y gwaith yr ydym wedi bod yn ei wneud gyda'r Gweinidog Carl Sargeant o gwmpas TAN 20 a chynllunio. Mae trafodaethau positif wedi bod gyda'r Llywodraeth am y cronfeydd strwythurol a sicrhau bod y Gymraeg yn cael ei phrif ffrydio yn y trafodaethau hynny. Os ydych yn gofyn am fy marn i—ac nid wyf yn un sy'n mynegi barn yn aml—rwy'n credu ein bod ni, ar y cyd, yn dechrau datblygu dealltwriaeth o'r sialens a'r cyfle i wneud hynny, a'r pwysigrwydd o greu methodoleg. Mae'n dod yn ôl at y cwestiwn o ymchwil cadarn a'r hyn y gellir ei wneud i osod y Gymraeg ynghanol penderfyniadau polisi'r Llywodraeth.

[91] O ran integreiddio'r Gymraeg o ran eich gweithredu chi, o ran gweithlu a gweithredu o ddydd i ddydd, rwy'n ymwybodol eich bod chi yn fewnol, oherwydd ein bod ni ar hyn o bryd yn derbyn cynllun monitro o'ch cynllun iaith, wedi cymryd camau penodol i adnabod, drwy osod pencampwyr yn eu lle, yr angen i hybu defnydd o'r Gymraeg fel sgil yn y gweithle. Mae ein hymateb i'r adroddiad monitro ar ein safle gwe. Mae'n ymateb hir, oherwydd roedd yn adroddiad hir, a chredaf fod hynny yn adlewyrchu'r sylw rydych yn ei roi i'r Gymraeg. Fel yr ymateb i gwestiwn a ofynnwyd ynghynt, y sialens yw rhaeadru'r ymateb hwnnw i lawr drwy sefydliad mawr. Mae'r bwrdd cyfarwyddwyr yn gallu trafod a gwneud penderfyniadau, ond sicrhau ymlyniad i'r diwylliant hwnnw ar lawr gwlad sy'n sialens i chi, ac mae hynny'n parhau i fod yn sialens i'r Llywodraeth.

[92] **Leighton Andrews:** Sut y gallwn symud ymlaen yn y dyfodol ar y pwnc hwn?

[93] **Ms Huws:** Unwaith eto, gan mai chi fydd un o'r cyrff cyntaf a fydd yn gweithredu o fewn y gyfundrefn safonau, mae sawl her i chi. Mae angen sicrhau'r rhaeadru hwnnw o fewn y sefydliad; sicrhau bod pawb sy'n

policy decisions as a Government, and I think that that is something that arises in our annual report, namely how important it is that we see the Welsh language being placed centrally in policy considerations, and doing so by using robust methodology that can lead to change. I have already mentioned the social services and wellbeing Bill, and I have mentioned the work that we have been doing with the Minister Carl Sargeant on TAN 20 and planning. There have been positive discussions with the Government about the structural funds and ensuring that the Welsh language is mainstreamed in those discussions. If you are asking for my opinion—and I do not express it often—I think that we are jointly starting to develop an understanding of the challenge and the opportunity to do that, along with the importance of producing methodology. It comes back to the question of robust research and what can be done to place the Welsh language centrally in the Government's policy decision making.

In terms of integrating the Welsh language into your operations, with regard to the workforce and day-to-day activities, I am aware that you are internally, because we are currently receiving a monitoring scheme of your language scheme, have acknowledged, by appointing champions, the need to encourage the use of Welsh as a skill in the workplace. Our response to the monitoring report is on our website. It is a long response, because it was a long report, and I believe that that reflects the attention that you give to the Welsh language. As with the response to an earlier question, the challenge is to cascade that response down through a large organisation. The board of directors can discuss and make decisions, but the challenge for you is to ensure adherence to that at a grass-roots level, and that continues to be a challenge for the Government.

Leighton Andrews: How can we move forward in the future on this matter?

Ms Huws: Once again, as you will be one of the first bodies operating within the standards regime, there are many challenges for you. There is a need to ensure that cascading of information within the organisation; to ensure

gweithio yn y sefydliad yn gwybod bod y safonau yn berthnasol iddynt a bod perchnogaeth ar draws y Llywodraeth—yn weision sifil a gweision cyhoeddus yn y Llywodraeth; sicrhau bod hyfforddiant digonol yn cael ei roi yn ei le wrth i'r safonau gael eu gweithredu, a bod dealltwriaeth glir o oblygiadau hynny; buaswn hefyd yn dweud bod sialens i chi gyfleu i ddefnyddwyr eich gwasanaeth beth y gallant ddisgwyl wrth i chi fel Llywodraeth weithredu o fewn cyfundrefn safonau. Hynny yw, nid yw'n fwy o'r hyn y maent wedi ei wneud yn barod, ond bod hwn yn newid sylweddol. Mae hwn yn gyfle bendigedig i Lywodraeth Cymru i ddangos bod safonau yn gallu arwain at newid a gosod esiampl i'r awdurdodau lleol a'r parciau wrth wneud hynny.

[94] **Leighton Andrews:** Pwy sydd piau'r rôl weinyddu ar gyfer annog mwy o hynny?

[95] **Ms Huws:** Bydd safon hybu yn cael ei gosod ar Lywodraeth Cymru, ac mae gan bob corff sy'n ymwneud â'r iaith Gymraeg gyfrifoldebau i hybu. Mae gennyh chi, fel Llywodraeth, eich strategaeth iaith Gymraeg, ac mae Mesur y Gymraeg (Cymru) 2011 yn gosod swyddogaethau ar y comisiynydd i hybu a hwyluso defnydd o'r Gymraeg. Credaf fod cyfrifoldebau arnom ni i gyd mewn gwahanol ffyrdd ac mae'n rhaid inni gydweithio a chyd-ddeall beth mae hynny'n ei feddwl. Dylem beidio â dyblygu, ond gweld cyfleoedd i lenwi bylchau.

[96] **Mike Hedges:** Beth allwn ni ei wneud i annog y rhai hynny sy'n siarad tipyn bach o Gymraeg, fel fi, i'w defnyddio?

[97] **Ms Huws:** Y peth cyntaf pwysig sydd eisiau ei wneud yw creu cyfleoedd ac, unwaith eto, rydym wedi sôn am hyn yn barod. Rwyf hefyd yn credu bod sialens inni i roi hyder i'r unigolyn i ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg. Rydym yn clywed yn aml bobl ifanc a phobl nad ydynt mor ifanc â hynny yn dweud nad ydynt yn teimlo'n hyderus na'u bod yn gallu siarad Cymraeg, bod eu Cymraeg ddim yn gywir ac nad ydynt yn gwybod sut i dreiglo. Mae'n rhaid inni newid y diwylliant, hwyluso a'i wneud yn dderbyniol—ac, yn fwy na hynny, ein bod yn

that everyone who works within that organisation understands that standards are relevant to them and that there is ownership across Government, whether civil servants or public servants within Government; to ensure that adequate training is put in place as the standards are implemented, and that there is a clear understanding of those obligations; I would also say that there is a challenge for you to demonstrate to the users of your services what they can expect when you as a Government begin to operate within the standards regime. By that I mean that it is not more of the same, but a fundamental change. This is a great opportunity for the Welsh Government to show that standards can lead to change and to set an example to local authorities and the parks in doing that.

Leighton Andrews: Who owns the role in terms of administration in relation to encouraging more of that type of working?

Ms Huws: A standard relating to promotion is being placed on the Welsh Government and every organisation associated with the Welsh language has a responsibility with regard to promotion. You, as a Government, have your Welsh language strategy, and the Welsh Language (Wales) Measure 2011 places duties on the commissioner to promote and facilitate the use of Welsh. I believe that we all have responsibility in different ways and we have to collaborate and understand jointly what that means. We should not duplicate, but see this as an opportunity to address gaps.

Mike Hedges: What can we do to encourage those who speak a little Welsh, like me, to use it?

Ms Huws: The first important thing that needs to be done is to create opportunities and, once again, we have talked about this already. I also believe that there is a challenge for us to give confidence to that individual to use Welsh. We often hear young people and people who are not so young saying that they do not feel confident or that they cannot speak Welsh, that their Welsh is not correct and that they do not know how to mutate. We have to change the culture, facilitate and make it acceptable—and, more than that, we should praise people for

canmol pobl am ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg. Os na wnawn ni hynny ac os nad ydym yn rhoi'r camau bach hynny yn eu lle, nid wyf yn credu y byddwn yn llwyddo.

[98] Rwy'n poeni bod y pwyslais gormodol ar gywirdeb ieithyddol yn rhwystro pobl rhag defnyddio'r Gymraeg fel modd o gyfathrebu. Yr ail beth sydd eisiau ei wneud yw creu sefyllfaoedd lle mae pobl yn gallu defnyddio'r Gymraeg a gwneud hynny y tu allan i sefyllfa addysg a'r tu allan i sefyllfa ffurfiol lle maent yn gallu defnyddio'r Gymraeg. Rydym wedi sôn yn barod am chwaraeon ac o fewn y celfyddydau, ac am yr angen i wneud hynny'n hyderus.

[99] Yn anecdotaid, rydym yn gweithio gyda phobl ifanc. Rydym yn gweithio gyda *Funky Dragon*, yr Urdd a chlybiau ffermwyr ifanc i greu'r drafodaeth honno ymysg pobl ifanc am beth sydd ei angen er mwyn ei gwneud yn fwy derbyniol i bobl ifanc siarad Cymraeg. Clywais drafodaeth anhygoel yn ddiweddar rhwng dau weithiwr ieuencid o Wrecsam—yr oedd hyn mewn cyfarfod gyda fi—lle'r oedd un yn siarad Cymraeg a'r llall yn siarad Saesneg gan ddeall ei gilydd yn iawn. Hynny yw, roedd un yn teimlo'n hyderus i siarad Cymraeg, ond nid oedd y llall, a oedd yn deall Cymraeg, yn teimlo'n hyderus, ac roeddynt yn cael sgwrs wirioneddol ddwyieithog. Mae angen inni fod yn barod i feithrin y math honno sefyllfa, achos daw pwynt lle'r aiff yr un nad yw'n hyderus i ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg dros y ffin, a bydd yn dechrau siarad Cymraeg.

[100] Gallwn wneud pethau strwythurol, gallwn wneud pethau gyda'r trydydd sector a gallwn wneud pethau gyda chwaraeon, ond mae'n rhaid inni ganmol pobl sy'n defnyddio'r Gymraeg, a'i wneud yn brofiad buddiol yn hytrach na phrofiad lle maent yn cael eu cywiro.

[101] **Mr Williams:** I ychwanegu at hynny, nid ffenomenon Cymreig yn unig ydyw. Roedd y comisiynydd yng Nghaeredin yr wythnos diwethaf yn annerch seminar Cyngor Prydain ac Iwerddon. Roedd rhywun o Iwerddon yn dweud mae un o'r problemau sydd ganddynt hwy yno yw pobl yn ceisio cywiro pobl eraill, a bod hynny yn tanseilio hyder siaradwyr neu ddysgwyr. Rwy'n

speaking Welsh. If we do not do that and if we do not put those small steps in place, I do not believe that we will succeed.

I am concerned that the overemphasis on linguistic correctness acts as a barrier to people using the Welsh language for communication purposes. The second thing that we need to do is create situations where people can use Welsh and do so outwith the educational setting or a formal situation where they can use the Welsh language. We have already referred to sport and the arts, and to the need to do this with confidence.

Anecdotally, we work with young people. We work with Funky Dragon, the Urdd and the young farmers clubs to create that discussion among young people on what needs to be done to make it more acceptable for young people to speak Welsh. I heard an amazing discussion recently between two youth workers from Wrexham—this was during a meeting with me—with one speaking Welsh and the other English, and they understood each other perfectly. That is, one felt confident to use the Welsh language and the other, who understood Welsh, did not feel so confident, and they were having a truly bilingual conversation. We need to be ready to nurture that sort of situation, because there will come a point where the one who is not confident in using the Welsh language crosses that bridge and starts speaking Welsh.

We can do structural things, we can do things with the third sector and we can do things with sport, but we have to praise people who use the Welsh language, and make it a beneficial experience rather than an experience where they are corrected.

Mr Williams: To add to that, this is not only a Welsh phenomenon. The commissioner was in Edinburgh last week addressing a seminar of the British-Irish Council. Someone from Ireland said that one of the problems that they had there was people trying to correct people, which undermined the confidence of speakers or learners. I appreciate that you asked your question in Welsh, Mike, and in the same

gwerthfawrogi'r ffaith eich bod wedi gofyn eich cwestiwn yn Gymraeg, Mike, ac, yn yr un modd, Lindsay, roeddwn yn gwerthfawrogi eich cwestiwn chi.

[102] **Mike Hedges:** Siaradaf yn Gymraeg. Yn yr ardaloedd lle mae mwy na 70% o bobl yn siarad Cymraeg, a ddylai'r iaith fod yn flaenoriaeth gan gynllunwyr tai?

[103] **Ms Huws:** Dylai, yn sicr, yn yr ardaloedd hynny. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi bod yn rhoi cymaint o bwysau ar y Llywodraeth i sicrhau bod TAN 20 diwygiedig yn gweld golau dydd ac yn cael ei gyhoeddi. Buaswn i'n dadlau bod angen rhoi blaenoriaeth nid yn unig yn yr ardaloedd lle mae mwy na 70% o'r gymuned yn siarad Cymraeg; rwy'n credu fod hon yn ystyriaeth bwysig ar draws Cymru. Yr hyn sydd angen ei wneud yw rhoi cyfarwyddiadau cadarn i gynllunwyr y tu ôl i'r TAN 20 diwygiedig sydd wedi cael ei gyhoeddi, a methodoleg gadarn i gynllunwyr ym mhob man yng Nghymru i ystyried y Gymraeg fel un o'r materion y dylid ei ystyried o ran cynllunio a datblygiadau tai.

[104] Rwyf braidd yn boenus, oherwydd rwyf wedi clywed datganiad y Gweinidog y bydd TAN 20 yn bwydo i mewn i gynlluniau datblygu lleol. Mae'n eithriadol o bwysig bod cyfarwyddiadau clir yn cael eu rhoi i'r awdurdodau lleol hynny sydd eisoes wedi ysgrifennu a chyhoeddi eu cynllun datblygu lleol, oherwydd maent yn gofyn am gyfarwyddyd, ac hefyd yr ardaloedd hynny lle nad yw'r cynllun datblygu lleol wedi cael ei derfynu a'i gyhoeddi. Yr hyn yr ydym yn ei bigo fyny oddi wrth cynllunwyr yw eu bod yn nerfus a'u bod yn teimlo nad yw'r arfau gyda nhw i wneud penderfyniadau ar sail tystiolaeth. Mae eisiau i ni gael methodoleg gadarn, broffesiynol o ran sut mae'r Gymraeg yn cael ei hystyried ym mhob ardal, ond mae'n eithriadol o bwysig yn yr ardaloedd hynny lle mae cymunedau gyda mwy na 70% o bobl yn siarad Cymraeg.

[105] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I ddod yn ôl at TAN 20, y realiti yw nad yw TAN 20 yn cael unrhyw effaith o gwbl ar ddatblygiadau tai ar hyn o bryd. Maent yn gwneud yr asesiadau o'r effaith ar y Gymraeg, ond nid oes neb yn cymryd unrhyw sylw ohonynt. A

manner, Lindsay, I appreciated your question.

Mike Hedges: I will speak in Welsh. In those areas where more than 70% of people speak Welsh, should the language be a priority for housing planners?

Ms Huws: It certainly should be in those areas. That is why we have been putting so much pressure on the Government to ensure that the revised TAN 20 sees the light of day and is published. I would argue that priority needs to be given not only to the areas where more than 70% of the community speaks Welsh; I believe that this is an important consideration across Wales. What needs to be done is to give robust guidelines, alongside the revised TAN 20 that has been published, for planners, and a robust methodology for planners across Wales to consider the Welsh language as one of those issues that should be considered in planning and housing developments.

I am rather concerned, because I heard the Minister's statement that TAN 20 will feed into local development plans. It is very important that clear guidance is given to those local authorities who have already formulated and published their local development plan, because they are asking for guidance, and also those areas where the local development plan has not yet been completed and published. What we are picking up from planners is that they are nervous and feel that they do not have the tools to make evidence-based decisions. We need to have a robust, professional methodology as to how the Welsh language is considered in every area, but it is particularly important in those areas where more than 70% of the community speaks Welsh.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Coming back to TAN 20, the reality is that TAN 20 has no impact whatsoever on housing developments at present. They undertake the assessments of the impact on the Welsh language, but no-one takes any notice of them. Is there any

oes unrhyw arwydd y byddai TAN 20 diwygiedig yn gwneud unrhyw fath o wahaniaeth?

indication that the revised TAN 20 will make any difference?

[106] **Ms Huws:** Yr hyn sy'n bwysig i'w sicrhau yn y man cyntaf yw bod TAN 20 yn arf cadarn sy'n cael ei barchu a'i ddefnyddio gan gynllunwyr, ac, i wneud hynny, mae angen methodoleg gadarn y tu ôl i ddatganiad polisi. Nid wyf yn credu bod hynny wedi bodoli cyn hynny. Tan bod hynny yn ei le, mae'r disgwyliad ar gynllunwyr yn anghyson. O ran tystiolaeth i'r dyfodol, mae'n anodd; nid wyf yn gallu edrych ymlaen, ond yr hyn sydd ei angen yn y man cyntaf yw TAN 20 sy'n gadarn, sy'n gwneud synnwyr i gynllunwyr, ac sy'n seiliedig ar fethodoleg gadarn a derbyniol iddyn nhw.

Ms Huws: What is important in the first instance is that TAN 20 is a robust tool that is respected and used by planners, and, to do that, a robust methodology is needed to underpin a policy statement. I do not think that that has existed previously. Until that is in place, the expectation on planners is inconsistent. In terms of evidence for the future, it is difficult; I cannot foresee what will happen, but what is needed in the first place is a robust TAN 20 that makes sense to planners and which is based on a methodology that is robust and acceptable to them.

12:00

[107] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr hyn yw TAN yw nodyn cyngor technegol—dyna yw ei ystyr, ac felly mae'n dibynnu ar sut ydych yn mynd ati i weithredu hynny. Cyfrifoldeb pwy yw hynny? Ai cyfrifoldeb y Llywodraeth ydyw i ddweud mewn ffordd gryfach o lawer wrth lywodraeth leol fod disgwyl iddi ei weithredu a'i ystyried yn ddifrifol, neu a yw hyn yn ymwneud â'r ffordd y mae'n cael ei ddehongli gan lywodraeth leol a bod angen i lywodraeth leol fod yn llawer iawn mwy *prescriptive* yn y ffordd y mae'n dehongli, neu a yw, o bosib, yn gyfuniad o'r ddau?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: What TAN is is a technical advice note—that is its meaning, and therefore it depends on how you go about putting that into practice. Whose responsibility is that? Is it the Government's responsibility to tell local government in a more forceful manner that there is an expectation on it to implement this and to consider it seriously, or is it about the way that it is interpreted by local government and that local government needs to be much more prescriptive in the way that it interprets it, or is it possibly a combination of both?

[108] **Ms Huws:** Rwy'n ymwybodol mai nodyn cyngor yw nodyn technegol, i bob pwrpas. Byddwch chi yn yr adeilad hwn yn ystyried yn fuan iawn, cyn y Nadolig rwy'n deall, y drafft cyntaf o Fil cynllunio, ac rwy'n credu bod hyn yn gyfle i edrych ar sut mae'r Gymraeg yn cael ei gosod yn gadarn o fewn gweithdrefn, polisiau a statud cynllunio yma yng Nghymru.

Ms Huws: I am aware that a technical advice note is, to all intents and purpose, an advisory note. Those of you in this building will be considering very soon, before Christmas, the first draft of a planning Bill, and I believe that this is an opportunity to look at how the Welsh language is placed very firmly within planning procedure, policies and statute here in Wales.

[109] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Hoffwn droi yn gyflym at yr arolwg o'r iaith Gymraeg o fewn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Rwy'n credu eich bod wedi esbonio pam wnaethoch chi ddewis y maes hwnnw a'r hyn rydych yn ei wneud o fewn y maes hwnnw. Yn dilyn hynny, felly, a oes meysydd neu faterion eraill sydd wedi eu clustnodi yn barod fel rhai y mae angen arolwg ohonynt?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I would like to turn briefly to the review of the Welsh language in the health service. I believe that you have explained why you have chosen that field and what you are doing in that field. As a result, therefore, are there any areas or other issues that have been earmarked already as ones that need reviewing?

[110] **Ms Huws:** Rydym wedi sôn am yr ymholiad iechyd. Hoffwn ddweud nad oedd unrhyw fwriad na disgwyliad gennym ni fel corff, wrth inni gael ein sefydlu, y buasem yn defnyddio adran 7, ond daeth cymaint o dystiolaeth anecdotaidd oddi wrth unigolion yn poeni am iechyd nad oedd gennym ni ddim dewis; roedd yn rhaid inni edrych ar y maes gofal sylfaenol a dyna pam y gwnaethom y penderfyniad hwnnw. Wrth sôn am y dyfodol, mae'r ymholiad yn mynd yn ei flaen. Mae'r dystiolaeth sy'n dod i fewn yn ddefnyddiol a chadarn. Rwy'n gobeithio y bydd yn arwain at adroddiad cynhwysfawr, ond adroddiad sydd wir yn dwyn pwysau ar y rhai hynny sy'n gwneud penderfyniadau polisi yng Nghymru.

Ms Huws: We have talked about the health inquiry. I just want to say that we did not have any intention or expectation as a body, as we were being established, that we would use section 7, but we had so much anecdotal evidence from individuals concerned about health that we had no choice; we had to look at the primary care area, and that is why we took this decision. In thinking about the future, the inquiry is ongoing. The evidence that is coming in is useful and robust. I hope that it will lead to a comprehensive report, but a report that genuinely brings pressure to bear on those who make policy decisions in Wales.

[111] Pe bawn i'n edrych i'r dyfodol, rwy'n credu mai'r maes yr ydym ni wedi ei adnabod fel maes lle mae angen inni ddeall yn well beth sy'n digwydd yw sgiliau ac addysg ôl-16. Rydym yn buddsoddi'n sylweddol yng Nghymru o ran addysg cyn-16 a'r Gymraeg, ac, fel mae Gwyn wedi dweud, dylai hynny fod yn arwain at weithlu dwyieithog. Beth sy'n digwydd sy'n golygu nad yw hynny'n digwydd? Beth sydd ddim yn cael ei roi yn ei le? A ydym yn colli cyfleoedd, neu a ydym yn gwneud pethau mewn ffyrdd sy'n sicrhau bod pobl ifanc yn troi'u cefn ar y Gymraeg? Mae angen i ni edrych ar faes addysg, sgiliau ac anghenion gweithlu'r dyfodol.

If we were to look to the future, the area that we have acknowledged as being an area where we need to better understand what is happening is the area of skills and education post-16. We invest significantly in Wales in pre-16 education and the Welsh language, and, as Gwyn has said, that should be leading to a bilingual workforce. Given that that is not happening, we must ask what is going on. Are we missing opportunities, or are we doing things in a way that leads young people to turn their backs on the Welsh language? We need to look at the area of education, skills and the needs of the future workforce.

[112] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Diolch yn fawr iawn am hynny; mae'n anodd iawn anghytuno â'r dewis hwnnw.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Thank you very much for that; it is very difficult to disagree with that choice.

[113] **Jenny Rathbone:** I would just like to clarify the weight that you think health boards should give to appointing people who are bilingual to posts where there are shortages of clinicians and so on and where it is difficult to fill posts? Are you of the view that, while the ability to speak both languages is desirable, the clinical skills of the applicant has to be the overriding factor in the decision on who is the best candidate?

[114] **Ms Huws:** Nid ydym wedi cyhoeddi'r adroddiad eto, ond yr hyn sy'n dod yn glir i ni, er bod sgiliau clinigol yn eithriadol o bwysig—ac, ar ddiwedd y dydd, os ydych yn cael triniaeth lawfeddygol, rydych yn poeni llai am iaith y person sy'n cynnal y llawdriniaeth—yw bod angen i fyrrdau iechyd a phobl sy'n darparu gwasanaethau iechyd adnabod anghenion

Ms Huws: We have not published the report yet, but what is becoming clear to us is that although clinical skills are exceptionally important—and, at the end of the day, if you are having surgery, your main concern will not be the language spoken by the surgeon—what is coming through clearly is that there is a need for health boards and people who provide health services to acknowledge

cyfathrebu yn y manau hynny lle mae hyn yn bwysig i'r defnyddiwr. Y lleoedd hynny yr ydym yn eu hadnabod yn awr yw'r pwynt cyswllt cyntaf gyda gofal ac iechyd: pan fyddwch yn cerdded mewn i weld y meddyg teulu am y tro cyntaf ac yn poeni, neu'r tro cyntaf y mae person sy'n dioddef strôc yn cael y cyswllt hwnnw gyda rhywun sy'n cynnig gwasanaeth iechyd iddynt. Gall y person hwnnw fod yn nyrs neu'n rhywun ar y dderbynfa. Yr ydym yn gweld camau cadarnhaol yn cael eu cymryd pan fydd pobl sy'n darparu gwasanaethau, boed hynny mewn ysbyty neu feddygfa, yn adnabod yr angen hwnnw ac yn ei ffactora i mewn wrth edrych ar sifft—pwy sydd ar sifft, pryd mae rhywun sy'n gallu siarad Cymraeg ar sifft, ac a ydynt yn gallu sicrhau cysondeb bod o leiaf un person ar bob sifft sy'n gallu delio â chleifion yn y Gymraeg. Rwy'n credu mai dyna sy'n bwysig: adnabod yr adegau hynny y mae'n hollbwysig i allu cyfathrebu, a chydnabod hynny fel sgil pwysig ar y pwynt hwn.

[115] Rydym wedi cael trafodaethau buddiol gyda'r cyrff proffesiynol, gan gynnwys Cymdeithas Feddygol Prydain, y Coleg Nyrsio Brenhinol ac yn blaen. Rwy'n credu bod dealltwriaeth yn datblygu ynglŷn ag adnabod angen, adnabod pryd mae'r angen hwnnw yn angen clinigol ac ymateb i'r angen hwnnw.

[116] **Christine Chapman:** I have one final question. You talked about ensuring that we look at skills and the needs of post-16 education. Looking forward, are there any other priorities in terms of what you would like to achieve in the next few years?

[117] **Ms Huws:** Mae hwnnw'n gwestiwn mawr. Rwy'n credu, wrth edrych ymlaen, ein bod wedi gosod allan yn ein cynllun strategol y pum maes yr ydym yn edrych arnynt. Fodd bynnag, os ydych yn gofyn i fi, fel comisiynydd, beth fyddai rhywbeth a fyddai'n agos at lwyddiant, mae cant a mil o atebion. Yr un peth, ac rwy'n credu imi fynegi hyn heddiw, yw bod y Gymraeg yn cael ei chydnabod fel un o ystyriaethau canolog polisi yng Nghymru, a'i bod yn rhan o'r fframwaith i greu, cynllunio a gweithredu polisi yng Nghymru—nid yn rhywbeth sy'n digwydd wedyn, ond yn rhan o'r patrwm sy'n cynnwys cydraddoldebau a chynaliadwyedd—a hefyd ein bod yn cydnabod ein bod yn wlad ddwyieithog a'r

communication needs in those places where it is important for the user. The areas where we are recognising that that is true are the first points of contact with the health service: when you go to the general practitioner for the first time and are concerned, or the first time that a person suffering a stroke has that first point of contact with someone who offers a health service to them. That person can be a nurse or someone at reception. Where we are seeing positive steps being taken is where people who provide services, be that in a hospital or a surgery, recognise that need and factor it in as they look at shifts—who is on shift, when someone who can speak Welsh is on shift, and whether they can ensure consistency that there is a least one person on a shift who can deal with patients in the Welsh language. I think that that is what is important: to acknowledge those periods when it is important to be able to communicate, and to acknowledge that as an important skill at that point.

We have had very beneficial discussions with the professional bodies, including the British Medical Association, the Royal College of Nursing and so on. I think that there is understanding developing in relation to recognising need, recognising when that need is a clinical need and responding to that need.

Ms Huws: That is a big question. I think, in looking forward, that we have set out in our strategic plan what the five areas that we will be looking at are. However, if you are asking me, as a commissioner, what something close to success would be, there are a hundred and one answers. The one thing, which I think I have expressed today, would be for the Welsh language to be recognised as one of the central considerations in policy making, and for it to be part of the framework of creating, planning and implementing policy—not something that happens afterwards, but something that it is part of the pattern that includes equalities and sustainability—and also that we recognise that we are a bilingual country and what the

hyn y mae statws swyddogol i'r Gymraeg yn ei olygu o ran polisi.

official status of the Welsh language means in terms of policy.

[118] Yr ail beth rwy'n credu a fyddai'n dod â ni'n nes at lwyddiant yw ein bod yn dechrau cynhyrchu'r gweithlu dwyieithog bywiog hwnnw: ein bod yn adeiladu ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd o fewn y system addysg cyn 16 oed, a'n bod yn gweld y bobl ifanc hynny yn dod allan yn hyderus ac yn defnyddio'r Gymraeg o fewn y maes gwaith fel nad yw cyflogwyr yn troi atom ac yn dweud, 'Dy'n ni ddim yn gallu'u ffeindio nhw'. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod y 129 o bobl ifanc a welais yn Nhrefafod, a oedd yn astudio iechyd a gofal, yn mynd allan i'r byd iechyd a gofal ac yn cyfrannu, a bod hynny'n creu newid.

The second thing that I think would bring us closer to success is that we start to produce this bilingual workforce: that we build on what is happening in the pre-16 education system, that we see those young people coming out confident and using the Welsh language in the workplace, so that employers do not turn to us and say, 'We can't find them'. We need to ensure that those 129 young people who I saw in Trehafod recently, who are studying health and social care, will go out into the world of health and social care and contribute to it, and that that creates a change.

[119] Rwy'n credu bod angen i'r Gymraeg fod yn ganolog i bolisi a bod angen i weithlu dwyieithog ddechrau cael ei gynhyrchu sy'n hyderus yn gweithio. Wrth gwrs, rwy'n credu—beth bynnag yw teimladau gwahanol unigolion ynglŷn â safonau—fod angen inni greu cyfundrefn safonau a rheoleiddio nad yw'n ymarferiad biwrocraataidd ond sy'n arwain at newid profiad y defnyddiwr gwasanaethau yng Nghymru a darparwyr gwasanaethau yng Nghymru. Dyna'r tri pheth.

I think that Welsh needs to be central to policy and that a bilingual workforce needs to start being produced that is confident working through the medium of Welsh. Of course, I think that—whatever different individuals' feelings are about standards—we need to create a standards and regulatory regime that is not a bureaucratic exercise, but one that leads to changing the experience of service users in Wales and service providers in Wales. Those are the three things.

[120] **Christine Chapman:** On that note, I thank both of you for attending this morning. We will send you a copy of the transcript so that you can check it for accuracy. We thank you very much; we are very grateful for your attendance. For your information, and for Members as well, the committee will be taking evidence from the First Minister on 4 December on issues relating to the Welsh language. Thank you for attending

[121] For Members, the next meeting is on 20 November. The committee will be hearing from the anti-human-trafficking co-ordinator and members of the non-governmental organisation Anti-Human-Trafficking Frontline Forum Wales about their work. I would now like to close the public meeting, and I ask Members whether they could just stay for a couple of minutes.

[122] **Ms Huws:** A gaf i ddiolch i chi am y cwestiynau ac am eich gwrandawriad? Diolch yn fawr.

Ms Huws: May I thank you for the questions and for listening to us this morning? Thank you very much.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 12:10.
The meeting ended at 12:10.*